



UNIVERSIDAD DE QUINTANA ROO

División de Ciencias Políticas y Humanidades

TRANSLATION OF THE ARTICLE:

**“LOVE AND KNOWLEDGE: RECOVERING THE HEART THROUGH
CONTEMPLATION” BY ARTHUR ZAJONC AND AN ANALYSIS
OF THE TECHNIQUES USED BY THE TRANSLATOR**

Monografía

Para obtener el grado de

Licenciada en Lengua Inglesa

Presenta:

Karla Gabriela Crespo Alvarado

Chetumal, Quintana Roo, México, diciembre de 2018





UNIVERSIDAD DE QUINTANA ROO
División de Ciencias Políticas y Humanidades

Trabajo Monográfico elaborado bajo la supervisión del comité del programa de Licenciatura y aprobado como requisito para obtener el grado de:

LICENCIADA EN LENGUA INGLESA

COMITÉ DE TRABAJO MONOGRÁFICO

Asesor: _____
M.T.I. Argelia Peña Aguilar

Asesor: _____
M.E. Amparo Reyes Velázquez

Asesor: _____
M.A. Sonia Teresita Sansores Valencia

Chetumal, Quintana Roo, México, diciembre de 2018



ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

First of all, I would like to thank **God** for showering his blessings on me and providing me with everything that I required in completing this project.

I would like to express my gratitude towards **my parents** who gave me the life, their love and support when I needed it.

I would like to record my deep appreciation to my supervisors:

To **M.T.I. Argelia Peña Aguilar**, whom I am extremely grateful for her expert, sincere and valuable guidance. Her help and constant supervision as well as providing necessary information regarding this project were vital. Thanks professor for your patience and advices that made possible to finish this monograph.

To **M.E. Amparo Reyes Velázquez**, I wish to express my sincere gratitude to her for her valuable time she took for revising the Spanish translation of this monograph. Her comments were crucial to the final version of this work.

To **M.A. Sonia Teresita Sansores Valencia**, I would like to extend my sincere thanks to her for her time invested in supervising my work. Thanks to her professionalism and experience this project was carried out in the best possible way.

I would like to express my special gratitude to my love, **Amilcar**, who has been my biggest support during this process. Thanks a lot my love for encouraging me and being always by my side when I need you.

I desire to thank my daughters, **Valentina** and **Lidia**, who were my main motivation and inspiration to conclude this project. They unconsciously assisted me with her sweetness. Thanks my dear daughters for being the best in my life.

CONTENTS

	Page
1. INTRODUCTION.....	6
2. RATIONALE.....	9
3. OBJECTIVES.....	11
4. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK.....	12
4.1 The most recognized translation schools.....	12
4.1.1 The Russian School.....	12
4.1.2 The American School.....	13
4.1.3 The Canadian School.....	13
4.2 Vinay and Darbelnet's Techniques.....	14
4.2.1 Direct translation.....	14
4.2.1.1 Literal translation.....	14
4.2.1.2 Borrowing.....	15
4.2.1.3 Calque.....	15
4.2.2 The oblique or Indirect translation.....	16
4.2.2.1 Transposition.....	16
4.2.2.2 Modulation.....	16
4.2.2.3 Equivalence.....	17
4.2.2.4 Adaptation.....	17
4.2.3 Supplementary techniques by Vinay and Darbelnet.....	18
4.2.3.1 Expansion or amplification.....	18

4.2.3.2 Reduction.....	19
4.2.3.3 Compensation.....	19
5. METHODOLOGY.....	20
5.1 Translation Types.....	20
5.2 Translation Process.....	22
6. TRANSLATED ARTICLE.....	24
7. ORIGINAL ARTICLE.....	48
8. ANALYSIS.....	67
9. CONCLUSIONS.....	79
10. REFERENCES.....	82

1. INTRODUCTION

Thanks to translation, cultures can be expressed properly in the world. Translation is a very important tool of communication, given that people from different parts of earth can be communicated. Furthermore, nations keep in touch and informed among them about their most recent news. Translating a text is not only to change a series of words into another language, to translate means to inform human beings, despite linguistic barriers. There are two relevant aspects that are part of every translation task: the source language (original text) and the target language (the language it is to be translated into). These terms are very recurrent in the monograph study.

As the whole world is coming together based on information sharing and communicative advances, it is natural that there has been a constant demand and an unprecedented need for translation of ideas from one language to another. Translation is one of the most significant jobs in modern society. It plays a vital role in the performance of international companies, governments alike, human rights issues, technology, medicine, and of course, in education.

Most of translations are carried out in English due to it is now the most widely used language in the world. It has been well propagated around the planet, becoming the leading language of international events. Books, magazines, articles and newspapers written in English are available in many countries around the world. So that, most of information is given in English and people who do not master that language need to be informed too, English writings are translated in different languages every day.

A translator is able to convey written information in another language using his grammatical and cultural knowledge of the Source and Target Language (Duff, 1989). That is why a translator has to know the languages he works with very well. Additionally, the one who translates has to formulate ideas in words addressed to the readers, but it is vital to translate a text without changing its original meaning. The success of a translation is to maintain the genuine sense of the real text.

Translation is considered an art in which writings are translated using historical, cultural, and grammatical structures awareness from both languages, the source and target language.

Moreover, translation is known as the interpretation of the meaning of a text and its goal will be always to replace the same situation as the original one (Lefevere, 1992). Throughout the process of a translation, the translator has to be extremely organized and follow the several steps that this kind of work requires in order not to get lost through this challenging but gratifying task. Furthermore, in order to express the same idea as the original text, the one who translates has to use different methods, strategies and techniques, since it is impossible that a text can be translated just using one type of technique.

Due to the fact that Translation monograph studies as a final project is an interesting and rewarding work in order to get a B.A degree at the University of Quintana Roo, every year there are more English Language major students taking interest in this type of study. For that reason, this translation work was carried out as an attempt to contribute in a certain way as an example of a translation process and all the steps this kind of monograph requires to be fulfilled. This project was made as a means to satisfy the need of language research studies translated into Spanish for teachers and students who do not master English and wish to know more about what Contemplative Education is.

Contemplative Education is about the development of reflective, affective and ethical capacities in students at all levels of higher education. Contemplative education aims for the full and optimal development of the learner. It makes classroom for curiosity, surprise, delight, transcendence, transformation, and authentic encounter with others and the world. Contemplation calls us to go beyond our familiar conceptual categories and rigid representations of self, others, and world, changing us in fundamental and profound ways. Because Contemplative practices allow great insight into habitual ways of thinking, it has a profound power to alleviate stress do not only in students and teachers but also in anyone who follows this discipline (Zajonc, 2006).

At present, it is essential for the Mexican educational system to be aware of the importance of applying Contemplative Education in all schools in order to have a comprehensive education in Mexico, so that stress can be reduced, which is the main barrier for students to succeed.

It is important to mention that one of the goals of educators is to facilitate the learning process, and I personally think that, by implementing Contemplative Education in the classroom, students can be affected positively by reducing stress, cultivating awareness of the mind and body, and living at the present moment.

With the translation of this article, people who are interested in Contemplative Education can learn about different alternatives and strategies that improve teaching and learning process through contemplation.

Besides all that, this project is useful for anyone interested in translation due to this monograph work was carried out with the help of experts in this field. Moreover, this monograph is supported by a framework, a deep analysis of the techniques used by the translator following some theories in the translation field and a bibliography. This adds some more insight on the issues that can come up when difficulties arise in this kind of task.

2. RATIONALE

Education gives us the knowledge of the world around us. Thanks to education people build opinions and have points of view about everything in life. Education is important as it teaches us the right behavior, the good manners thus making us civilized, so education is the basis of culture and civilization. Besides, it teaches us how to lead our lives, and it is instrumental in the development of our values and virtues (Jeff, 1999). Education cultivates us into mature individuals, individuals capable of planning for our future and taking the right decisions. Nowadays, there are a lot of philosophies about teaching and learning that address to Contemplative Education due to its importance in the educational area.

The article translated for the purpose of completing this work is “Love and Knowledge: Recovering the Heart of Learning through Contemplation”. This is an interesting and fascinating article which points out the role of contemplative practices in higher education. The article creates awareness about the necessity of a pedagogy that attends to the development of reflective, contemplative, and affective capacities in students. The author presents an “epistemology of love,” which emphasizes a form of inquiry that supports close engagement and leads to student transformation. He includes a specific sequence of contemplative exercises that are practiced by students at an Amherst College first-year course. The experience shows that students deeply appreciate the change from the traditional coursework to a contemplative pedagogy (Zajonc, 2006). According to the outcomes presented by the author, it is clear that this kind of practices can facilitate students’ learning process and make it less stressful than for those who have a traditional teaching-learning experience.

This translation project was carried out in order to provide important information contained in the article “Love and Knowledge: Recovering the Heart of Learning through Contemplation” taken from the book *Teachers College Record: Contemplative Practices and Education*, written by Arthur Zajonc to Spanish language readers who do not master English but have a particular interest in Contemplative Education.

Furthermore, this monograph could be functional as reference for those whose objective is to conduct a study of the similar type and need additional bibliography, information of the topic, how to structure and organize this kind of work, etc.

Given that, the translated article contains specific terminology in the field of education with an emphasis in the contemplative area, this translation could serve as a reference for future translations which handle the same concepts.

In addition, this work could be useful for any translator who wants to make a translation analysis, study the most known translation strategies and techniques and the different methods and theories in this field.

The translation of this article will be useful in the educational field, more specifically, for the professor and researcher from the department of Language and Education, Argelia Peña Aguilar, who has been researching and implementing contemplation in education for the last years. She intends to develop a course for other educators on this topic, but in order to reach professors in other fields, this information has to be in Spanish, as well.

3. OBJECTIVES

The first objective of this monograph is to carry out a faithful translation work and convey the original idea of the article: “Love and Knowledge: Recovering the Heart of Learning through Contemplation” taken from the book *Teachers College Record: Contemplative Practices and Education*, written by Arthur Zajonc.

In addition, this translation has another purpose: to make accessible, understandable and easy to read the translated article for Spanish readers who are not skillful in the English language and who are interested in the Contemplative Education area.

This monograph work aims to be useful for those students who are interested in translation. Those students could use this work as a guide in order to have an idea of the steps to follow when translating, such as the theoretical framework, the way an analysis could be done and so on.

Another very important objective of this monograph is to contribute with one more example of this kind of final work in order to get a B.A degree at the University of Quintana Roo.

Nevertheless, the most important objective of this work is to break down language barriers between English and Spanish languages by making a bridge, thanks to the wonderful tool called translation. Therefore, Spanish language people who are interested in the use of Contemplation in Education can have access to this article.

4. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

4.1 The most recognized translation schools

Translation is to transfer a writing message from one language into another. As it was stated before, in order to translate, a translator has to apply to his grammatical and cultural knowledge of the languages he works with, the source and the target one. In the field of translation there are many different methods and techniques that can be used by translators. However, the most recognized schools in this area are three: the Russian, American and Canadian School.

4.1.1 The Russian School

The Russian School is proposed by the theorists Shveitser and Retsker. They outline two translation approaches: Translation as “analogy” and Translation as “adequacy”. According to the Russian point of view, an analogical translation is when the target text is equivalent to the source text, in this way a translation is adequate and effective, the form of the target text is new but the content is very close to the original. A translation as adequacy is applied when there is no equivalence, in this case the translator departs from the wording of the original text and from the dictionary offerings to use one or four of the following translation techniques: Concretization, Local derivation, Antonymic translation and Compensation. A translator should pay attention to the adequate form to express the same ideas from the source text. He should not have a free form of translation, nor force the target language by following the source text word for word. A translator should always keep in mind a standard language of the source and target and text.

4.1.2 The American School

The American School is suggested by Malone. He includes the five following translation techniques: Matching, Zigzagging, Recrecense, Repackaging and Reordering. Each technique is divided in two categories, Matching covers Substitution and Equation, Equation is the same as literal translation, where is not possible, it is replace by Substitution (transposition). Zigzagging deals with Divergence and Convergence which are generic terms of this technique. It is used in situations where the source language has what are called doublets, it means that two words signify the same thing but often with some kind of connotional difference. Recrecense applies Amplification and Reduction, Amplification provides explanations rather than making cultural adaptations, Reduction is the omission of information considered to be unnecessary. Repackaging involves Diffusion and Condensation, the first one expresses the same information in a longer form, and the second cuts out parts of the text that might be boring, obscene or politically problematic. It is less frequent since it should only depend on the direction of translation. And the last technique is Reordering where word order becomes necessary because of complex structures.

4.1.3 The Canadian School

The Canadian School is headed by Jean Paul Vinay and Jean Darbelnet. Since there are a lot of procedures and techniques involved in translation, undoubtedly, this approach is the most famous and the most criticized. These techniques are divided in the Direct translation (Calque, Borrowing, and Literal) and the Oblique (indirect) translation(Transposition, Equivalence, Adaptation and Modulation) which are at morphosyntactic level (grammatical relation). Furthermore, there are three more styles of translation (expansion, reduction and compensation) that are supplementary to the first seven and they are at semantic level (conceptual notions). The three schools are very important in the translation field, nevertheless the Canadian method is the most recognized, accepted and used by the professional translators, because it is the easiest and

the most flexible to apply due to they can be applied at the linguistic level of lexis, grammar, and text.

4.2 Vinay and Darbelnet's Techniques

As it was stated before, the Canadian method is divided in two groups, the Direct and Oblique or Indirect translation and three more styles (expansion, reduction and compensation) which complement the Direct and Oblique translation.

4.2.1 Direct translation (involves three techniques)

4.2.1.1 Literal translation

Literal translation: This type of translation is also called word for word. It is the most common when translating between two languages of the same family, for example Spanish with French and Italian and when they also share the same culture. A text can go from one language into another with no changes other than those required by the target language grammar.

Examples:

- **I like to do exercise in the mornings.**
 - **Me gusta hacer ejercicio en las mañanas.**

- **Gabriela arrived late to the party.**
 - **Gabriela llegó tarde a la fiesta.**

4.2.1.2 Borrowing

Borrowing: The source language form is taken into the target language when there is a concept that does not exist in the target language.

Examples:

- **Pablo drank tequila in the meeting.**
➤ **Pablo bebió tequila en la reunión.** *Borrowed word*

- **Taco is a traditional Mexican food.**
➤ **El taco es una comida tradicional mexicana.** *Borrowed word*

4.2.1.3 Calque

Calque: A calque is a special kind of borrowing whereby an expression or word is borrowed from the source language and it is translated literally.

Examples:

- **Football**
➤ **Balompíe**

- **Science-fiction**
➤ **Cienciaficción**

4.2.2 The Oblique or Indirect translation

The Oblique or Indirect translation involves the following four techniques:

4.2.2.1 Transposition

Transposition: It involves replacing one word class with another without changing the meaning of the message.

Examples:

- **Patty merely nodded.**
 - **Patty se limitó a asentir.**
- Adverb }
Verb } *In this example the adverb **merely** was replaced with the verb **limitó**.*
-
- **Before you come back, I will be ready.**
 - **Antes de tu regreso, estaré lista.**
- Verb }
Noun } *In this example the verb **cameback** was changed into the noun **regreso**.*

4.2.2.2. Modulation

Modulation: it is a variation in the message, obtained by a change in the point of view. This technique requires extensive knowledge of the target language.

Examples:

- **“It seems not unlikely”.**
 - **“Esmuy probable”.**
- Doble negation }
Affirmative } *Here the **negative** sentence was turned into an **affirmative** one.*

- **“We must do what we were told”**
 - **“Debemos hacer lo que nos dijeron”**
- Passivevoice
 Activevoice
- } Here the *passive form*
 } was changed into an
 } *active form*.

4.2.2.3 Equivalence

Equivalence: Vinay and Darbelnet define equivalence as the translation of idioms, sayings, clichés, onomatopoeias or proverbs when two languages refer to the same situation in totally different ways. It is based essentially on language meaning.

Examples:

- **“Never judge a book by its cover”.**
 - **“Las aparienciasengañan”.**
- } *Saying*
- **“Have a good time!”**
 - **“¡Diviértete!”**
- } *Cliché (overused expression)*

4.2.2.4 Adaptation

Adaptation: It is used in those cases where the type of situation being referred to by the SL message is unknown in the TL culture. In such situations translators have to create a new situation that can be considered as being equivalent. So, adaptation can be described as a kind of equivalence.

Examples:

- **Face off.**
 - **Contra Cara.**
- } Movie title

- **The Day the Earth Stood Still.**
 - **Ultimátum a la Tierra.**
- } Movie title

4.2.3 Supplementary techniques by Vinay and Jean Darbelnet

The last three following techniques are also considered by Vinay and Darbelnet and they are complementary to the first seven.

4.2.3.1 Expansion or amplification

Expansion or amplification: It is applied for structural reasons and for greater comprehensibility. This procedure consists of adding more words to the target message without affecting the original meaning (Lopez and Minett, 1999).

Examples:

- **Before Gettysburg. . .**
- **Antes de la batalla de Gettysburg. . .**

- **Endnote**
- **Nota al final del texto.**

4.2.3.2 Reduction

Reduction: Some elements are removed without modifying the original sense of the source text (Ibid). In reduction procedure unnecessary words are omitted because of structural and stylistic reasons.

Examples:

- Terms and Conditions

➤ **Clausulas**

- Last Will and Testament

➤ **Testamento**

4.2.3.3 Compensation

Compensation: According to Vinay and Darbelnet, compensation introduces a SL element of information or stylistic effect in another place in the TL text because it cannot be reflected in the same place as in the SL. So, the aim of compensation is to balance the semantic losses that translation implicates. This technique is a combination of the expansion and reduction styles.

Example:

- Boy, it began to rain like a bastard. In buckets, I swear to God.

➤ **¡Jo! ¡De pronto empezó a llover a cántaros! Un diluvio se lo juro.**

5 METHODOLOGY

Before translating in any language it is vital to recognize the type of text it is and the function of its language in order to carry out a good translation work. It is important to mention that there are three basic functions of the language: informative (words can be used to pass on information), expressive (words can be used to evoke an emotion that is not a direct result of their meaning) and directive (words can be as a kind of symbol / action in and of themselves). The most familiar function of the language is informative, it transmits information. But it also operates expressively, when we attend to the feelings evoked by the words rather than just their meaning. Poetry often combines the informative and the expressive. Directive language is based on commands and requests. Also, in its directive sense, language is like any other gesture or symbol: the handshake or the military salutes are examples of this kind of function (Shan, 2012).

There are three types of texts: the general, which is the most common, because it does not contain specific or technical terminology. The technical refers to certain fields that are focused on certain areas such as medicine, technology, and deals with texts such as manuals and instructions. And the literary is literature, such as novels, plays and poems.

5.1 Translation Types

The type of translation used by a translator depends on what type of information the text has. There are three types of translation: General, Technical and Literary translation.

General translation: This type of translation is the most common, because it does not contain specific or technical terminology. It means that the language used is not high level. Therefore, in order to do this kind of translation the translator does not have to be an expert in the theme he works with.

Technical translation: It usually refers to certain fields that are focused on certain areas such as medicine, technology, and deals with texts such as manuals and instructions. Technical

translations are usually better paid than general translations, because specialized terminology is used and only a translator who is specialized in the topic could deal with.

Literary translation: A literary translation is the translation of literature, such as novels, plays and poems. The translation of literary works is considered by many translators as the highest forms of translation, since this type of translation can transmit feelings, culture, humor, what is more it is able to transport the reader to the scene of the story.

As it was mentioned previously, this monograph work will be a technical translation, because the original text contains specific vocabulary (terminology referred to a particular area) about Education with an emphasis in Contemplation. Therefore, this is not a literary text. The main objective of the translator is to translate this article the closest to the original. Thus, according to the previous information, the text on which this project was developed is a technical text of informative function, due to the nature of the article is merely informative and it contains specific terminology in the field of education with a new emphasis in the contemplative area.

During the translation process there are many problems a translator faces. The first problem is related to reading and comprehension ability in the source language. Once the translator has coped with this obstacle, the most frequent translation difficulties are of semantic and cultural nature. Similarly, the person who translates often runs into those painful “not found” terms, for which not even the best dictionary, an expert in the topic or native speaker of the source language can provide us with a solution to convey an accurate meaning. Whatever the difficulty in the translation process, procedures must aim at the essence of the message. The quality of translation will depend on the excellence of the translator on his knowledge, skills, training, cultural background, expertise, and even mood (García, 1989). Unquestionable, the translation work is one of the most important in the world, thanks to this labor people from diverse nationalities can be informed and communicated despite their different languages.

5.2 Translation process

In the translation process there are two main steps. The first one consists of understanding the original text, and the second one consists of expressing the message into the target language without changing the original meaning of the source language.

In the first step it was necessary a general reading of the writing to have a general idea of the text. It is really important that a translator recognizes the genre of the text in order to see the kind of translation it is. Also, it was essential to check the sense of the text and understand what the author wants to say and the way he says it. For that reason, it was vital to identify the style of the author in the first reading. It was crucial to keep the thoughts and feelings of the writer to cause the same effect the author wants to cause in readers of the original text.

After that, it was indispensable to read again to find out unknown words and underline them to look for their meaning. In order to investigate and find out the unknown concepts and specific terminology it was required to search in a lot of different sources such as: bilingual, monolingual, electronic and online dictionaries. Besides, it was vital to consult articles, magazines, books, translation works and web sites that were related with the research topic.

In addition, interviews with professionals in the field of contemplative education and translation were carried out in order to clear up some doubts and solve problems during the translation process.

After having checked all the materials (sources of information, bibliography, dictionaries and experts) the translation process started. The first draft of the translation was written and given to the supervisor of this project in order for her to review it and give suggestions. Afterwards, a second draft was done and checked. Then, a couple more of drafts were written before the final translation.

Previous to the analysis of the translation, it was necessary to identify some of the most significant problems during the translation process in order to identify what strategies or techniques were used to overcome them. For instance, some of the most common difficulties a translator faces are when he has to translate idioms, quotations, adverbs, sayings, etc. for the reason that, it is necessary to know the cultural background of the source and target language.

Later, the analysis of the translation was done. As it was stated before, the analysis of this monograph work was carried out using the translation techniques stated by the most important theorists in the field of translation, Jean Paul Vinay and Jean Darbelnet. These techniques are the easiest to analyze since they let the translator has some freedom in his decisions at the moment of translating a text.

To carry out the analysis of the translation, it was required to identify the examples of each technique. They were taken from the original and target text, in its final version. After having found the examples, they were analyzed and briefly explained using the ten translation styles of the Canadian theorists. As it was mentioned previously, these techniques are divided in the Direct translation and the Oblique or Indirect translation. The Direct technique includes three styles of translation: Calque, Borrowing and Literal. The Oblique technique includes four styles of translation: Transposition, Equivalence, Adaptation and Modulation. The last three following styles are complementary to the first seven: Expansion or amplification, Reduction and Compensation.

Finally, there was a last review of the analysis along with the translation in order to see if they matched. The analysis of the translation was the most complex part of the translation; nevertheless, it was a rewarding and fascinating task to accomplish.

It is really important to state that the three supervisors (Argelia Peña, Sonia Sansores and Amparo Reyes) who directed this project played a very significant role. Due to they are experts in the translation, contemplative theme and writing in Spanish their support was essential to carry out this project in the best possible way.

6 TRANSLATED ARTICLE

Amor y conocimiento: recuperando la importancia del aprendizaje a través de la contemplación

Arthur Zajonc

Amherst College

El papel que desempeña la práctica contemplativa en la educación para adultos tiene una larga historia, si se tomara en cuenta la educación monástica tradicional de Asia y del Occidente. El uso de la contemplación en la educación superior en Norteamérica es, sin embargo, más reciente y más limitado. No obstante, según algunas encuestas y conferencias, existe una comunidad significativa de maestros en todos los niveles de educación superior, desde universidades comunitarias hasta universidades que se enfocan en la investigación, en las cuales se están usando un amplio rango de prácticas contemplativas como parte de la pedagogía regular en sus salones de clase. Además de la existencia de métodos pedagógicos y curriculares bien desarrollados que inculcan el desarrollo del razonamiento, la lectura y escritura crítica y el análisis cuantitativo, en este artículo se sugiere la necesidad de una pedagogía que atienda al desarrollo de capacidades reflexivas, contemplativas, afectivas y éticas en nuestros estudiantes. La importancia de éstas es, por lo menos, tan grande como el desarrollo de capacidades críticas en estudiantes. En este contexto está justificado el motivo para la inclusión de modalidades contemplativas. Con base en la gran experiencia de enseñanza en la Universidad de Amherst, les presento una “epistemología de amor”, la cual enfatiza una forma de reflexión que busca el compromiso y conduce a los estudiantes a la transformación y comprensión. Este enfoque que conlleva al conocimiento, es implementado en la Universidad de Amherst en un curso del primer año de licenciatura, el cual se llama, Amor y Comprensión. En éste, se incluye una secuencia de ejercicios contemplativos que realizan los estudiantes en clase y, además, se integra en el curso un contenido más convencional derivado de las artes y las ciencias. Nuestra experiencia demuestra que los estudiantes aprecian profundamente el cambio en la forma de trabajar de un curso convencional a una pedagogía más experimental, transformativa y reflexiva.

La tarea de la política es prevenir los conflictos;
la de la educación es establecer la paz.

Montessori

Es un privilegio agregar mis pensamientos sobre este tema a aquellos que ya hemos escuchado. Jon KabatZinn nos ha hablado acerca de la unión del conocimiento y la contemplación, recordándonos qué tan accesible es la atención plena y qué tan difícil puede ser tenerla presente en todos los aspectos de la vida. Marilyn Nelson nos platicó su experiencia en la enseñanza del silencio en aquellos que llevan una vida de peleas y conflictos. Recordamos la historia del joven policía quien simuló estar escuchando música con sus auriculares, cuando en realidad todo lo que él estaba escuchando era al silencio. Nosotros hemos participado en debates y talleres en donde se sugiere que las prácticas contemplativas pueden ser un método pedagógico importante para nosotros mismos y nuestros estudiantes. Además, hemos escuchado sobre la importancia de estar en armonía con nosotros mismos para fomentar y mantener la paz en el mundo. Lamento únicamente no haber tenido la oportunidad de hablar con todos ustedes para conocer lo que están haciendo con la contemplación, cuáles son sus preguntas y lo que están planeando para implementarla. A este aglomerado de experiencias y percepciones me gustaría agregar otro elemento, que es extremadamente difícil de discutir en academia, aún cuando debería ser central en su trabajo, concretamente, la relación entre el conocimiento (en el cual destacamos) y el amor (el cual descuidamos).

Primero, una observación personal: como científico puedo afirmar que cualquier intento de relacionar al conocimiento con sentimientos de amor parece una violación a las normas de etiqueta; es de mala educación, especialmente en un entorno público como éste. Sin embargo, he llegado a la conclusión de que el temor que sentí al mencionar este tema fue basado en las formas institucionales y particulares que contrarrestan nuestros intereses humanos fundamentales. Por lo tanto, dejemos de lado la desconfianza y el titubeo y exploren conmigo la posible relación entre el conocimiento, el amor y la contemplación.

Si preguntara qué es lo que debería ser central en nuestra enseñanza y el aprendizaje de nuestros estudiantes, ¿cuál sería la respuesta? De las múltiples labores que como profesores realizamos, ¿cuál es la tarea más importante de todas? ¿cuál es nuestra máxima ilusión para los

jóvenes que enseñamos? En sus cartas para el joven poeta Franz Kappus, RainerMariaRilke (1904-1954) respondió claramente:

Lo que la gente joven necesita es tomar al amor seriamente, sostenerlo y aprenderlo como tarea ... Que un ser humano ame a otro es tal vez la más difícil de todas nuestras tareas, la última y más importante prueba, el trabajo por el cual todos trabajan es solamente una preparación para lograrlo. Por esta razón, la gente joven, principiantes en todo, no pueden aún conocer el amor, ellos tienen que aprenderlo. Necesitan acercarlo con todo su ser y con todas sus fuerzas a su solitario, tímido y latente corazón, los jóvenes deben aprender a amar. (p.41)

No hay necesidad de remarcarlo. Los planes de estudio que ofrecen nuestras instituciones de educación superior ha descuidado en gran parte este tema difícil y central; la labor de aprender amar es también la obligación de aprender a vivir en verdadera paz y armonía con los demás y con la naturaleza.

Tenemos experiencia en enseñar a la mente a razonar, escribir y hablar de manera crítica, además la preparamos para el análisis científico y cuantitativo. Pero, acaso ¿es esto suficiente? En un mundo rodeado de conflictos internos y externos, ¿no es de igual o mayor importancia mantener un equilibrio de agudización en nuestro intelecto con la cultivación sistemática del amor en nuestros corazones?, ¿no necesitan mayor atención asuntos como la justicia social, medio ambiente y educación por la paz, además de que deberían tener un lugar importante en nuestras universidades y facultades? La respuesta a todas estas preguntas es, sí, por supuesto.

Aunque esto es algo indudablemente cierto, mi presentación no se concentrará en la idea de armonizar los logros intelectuales con las buenas obras. En este sentido me atrevería a decir que el conocimiento es parcial y distorsionado si nosotros no desarrollamos y practicamos una epistemología de amor en vez de una epistemología de separación. El lema de Harvard es *Veritas*, o *la Verdad*. Desde esta visión, el saber es proyecto central de la educación superior. Sin embargo, yo sostengo que la verdad en sí (*Veritas*) nos elude si llegamos a ella por medio de una epistemología de separación. Nuestra epistemología convencional nos lleva a una peligrosa falsificación de lo que representa la verdad, una que puede pasar por verdad, pero en realidad es parcial y pobre.

En 1993, durante una conferencia en Berea College, Parker Palmer señaló que “todo camino al conocimiento se convierte en una manera de vivir, toda epistemología se vuelve una ética”.¹ Él argumenta que la epistemología actual ha generado una ética vinculada a la violencia. Sin duda, la ciencia ha brindado enormes avances, sin embargo, no podemos hacer a un lado el hecho de que el énfasis moderno en la deshumanización nos predispone a un modo de ser egocéntrico y manipulativo en el mundo. Como Parker señaló en Berea, nuestro método para llegar al conocimiento se ha convertido en un estilo de vida. Las implicaciones de esta postura son numerosas. A pesar de que no estoy exigiendo rotundamente un retroceso de la ciencia, pido reubicarla en una visión más grande sobre lo que realmente son el conocer y vivir. Ese planteamiento del conocimiento tendrá consecuencias importantes en la educación, consecuencias que dan un prudente lugar a la pedagogía contemplativa. Espero realmente convencer de que la práctica contemplativa puede llegar a convertirse en una reflexión contemplativa filosófica, es la práctica de una epistemología de amor. La reflexión contemplativa no únicamente genera comprensión (*veritas*), sino que también transforma al participante a través de su íntima (se podría decir amorosa) participación en la atención contemplativa. La educación contemplativa es educación transformativa. A pesar de que en el 2000, la investigación inicial de Jack Mezirow en la facultad de ciencias de la educación sobre la enseñanza transformativa estaba enfocada en la reflexión crítica y no en la meditación, percibo su trabajo y el de las teorías de Robert Kegan (1982, 1994) como una muy apropiada ascendencia académica para entender la pedagogía contemplativa.

Por lo que antes expuse, propondré a continuación hacer un bosquejo de una epistemología de intimidad y participación, en otras palabras, una epistemología de amor que facilite la reflexión científica e intelectual de tal manera que no sea vista como problemática para la enseñanza académica o para las disciplinas de investigación. Posteriormente, describiré algunos de los elementos principales de un curso que impartí con un historiador de arte, Joel Upton, de Amherst. Este curso fue titulado Amor y Comprensión (*Eros and Insight*, en inglés), intenta ser ejemplo de esta forma de generar conocimiento, y retoma el desafío que nos presentó Rilke: el reto de aprender a amar.

UNA EPISTEMOLOGÍA DEL AMOR

Irónicamente, creo que primero necesitamos reconocer y aceptar como parte de nuestra realidad existencial la separación o soledad que experimentamos. Es un hecho que nos sentimos desconectados de los demás y también del mundo natural que nos rodea. El filósofo espiritual, Rudolf Steiner (1916-1995), consideraba que *Einsamkeit*, o soledad, era la “principal característica de nuestra época”(p.94). Su contemporáneo, Rilke (1904-1954), remarcó este tema más enfáticamente:

Nuevamente, al hablar de soledad, se hace cada vez más claro que este acontecimiento, en el fondo, no es algo que uno pueda aceptar o rechazar. Somos solitarios. Podemos autoengañarnos y actuar como si no lo fuéramos... Pero es mejor darse cuenta de que lo somos, y más aún, proponerse asumirlo. (p.50)

Considero la postura científica como un síntoma de este malestar psicológico y espiritual cada vez más generalizado. La soledad es el reflejo o inevitable correlación entre el yo y la identidad personal cada vez más desarrollados. En cuanto más se separen los individuos de los grupos étnicos y las mujeres se conviertan en personas más individuales, así también disminuirá la fuerza y lo conveniente de lo colectivo. Nuestra búsqueda por la identidad individual tiene la desventaja de terminar desidentificándonos de otras personas, grupos y naturaleza.

Aunque mucho se ha ganado a través de este proceso de individualización, logros que no deberíamos perder, si continuáramos así indefinidamente, lógicamente acabaríamos con una vasta colección de egoístas entidades. Estoy convencido de que la fuerza de compensación para tal fragmentación no corresponde al interés propio o a la acción económica racional que maximiza la utilidad (como los economistas lo pensarían); en su lugar, creo que las relaciones pueden ser genuinamente empáticas entre nosotros. Cada vez más, las relaciones no se dan entre tribus o grupos religiosos y étnicos, sino entre individuos. Las relaciones humanas saludables no ocurren

automáticamente, cada uno de nosotros debe cultivarlas intencionalmente. Nada en este mundo es gratis.

La misma lógica es aplicable sobre nuestra relación con el medio ambiente. Nosotros ya no crecemos cepillando caballos y arreando animales de carga en la granja. En la ciudad de Nueva York, puedes andar durante días sin caminar sobre tierra. Nuestra relación con la naturaleza debe ser igualmente intencional. La práctica de la contemplación forma parte importante de esa postura intencional; la que pueda llevarnos a prolongadas relaciones empáticas.

Una vez hecho el cambio intencional de aislamiento a relación empática, estamos preparados para una manera de saber contemplativa, una manera en cuya relación con el amor, pienso, es cada vez más evidente ¿cuáles son las características o etapas de una reflexión filosófica contemplativa?

Respeto

Cuando nos acercamos al objeto de nuestra atención contemplativa, lo hacemos con respeto y compostura. Con respecto a la relación con el ser amado, Rilke (1904-1975), sostuvo que “la unión entre dos personas es una imposibilidad” (p.28). En vez de una fácil fusión con el ser querido, Rilke insistió en que “el amor consiste en que, esas dos soledades se protejan, cuiden y se motiven uno al otro” (p.45). Igualmente, siento que la primera etapa de la reflexión contemplativa es respetar la integridad del otro, vigilar la preservación de su naturaleza, su soledad, ya sea un poema, una novela, un fenómeno de la naturaleza o la persona sentada delante de nosotros, necesitamos dejarlo expresar su verdad sin la influencia de nuestra proyección o corrección.

Sutileza

La reflexión contemplativa es sutil o delicada. En sus investigaciones científicas, Goethe (1988) intentó practicar lo que él llamó un “empirismo delicado (*zarteEmpirie*)” (p. 307). Si deseamos

acercarnos al objeto de nuestra atención sin distorsionarlo, entonces debemos ser sutiles. Por lo contrario, el empirismo de Francis Bacon hablaba de sacar los secretos de la naturaleza bajo condiciones extremas, poniéndola al límite.

Privacidad

La ciencia convencional se aleja de la naturaleza y, para usar el término de Erwin Schrödinger (1956-1967), la deshumaniza. De manera ideal, la ciencia se separa de los fenómenos por el bien de la objetividad. En contraste, la reflexión contemplativa se aproxima al suceso, delicada y respetuosamente, sin embargo, busca establecer una relación estrecha con su objeto de atención. Se puede mantener la cercanía entre la claridad y un juicio equilibrado si recordamos ejercitar la compostura y gentileza.

Participación

El acercamiento sutil conlleva la participación del indagador contemplativo en el suceso que se desarrolla. Las características exteriores nos invitan a ir más a fondo; nuestros movimientos y sentimientos se dejan llevar por el fenómeno natural, texto, pintura, o persona frente a nosotros, viviendo fuera de nosotros mismos y dentro de lo otro. En la meditación, nos unimos con el otro, respetuosa y delicadamente, mientras mantenemos conciencia plena y claridad de mente. En otras palabras, la reflexión contemplativa se centra, por experiencia, en el otro, no en nosotros mismos. Nuestras usuales preocupaciones, miedos, y ansias van en contra de una participación auténtica.

Vulnerabilidad

Para poder formar parte del otro sujeto, ser gentil en el sentido que aquí se indica, participar en verdad con el otro, debemos de confiar lo suficiente para ser vulnerables, de estar lo suficientemente seguros para renunciar al curso de las cosas. No servirá ser arrogantes, debemos de aprender a estar cómodos con lo desconocido, la ambigüedad e incertidumbre. Lo nuevo y desconocido puede surgir únicamente de lo que parece debilidad e ignorancia.

Transformación

Las últimas dos características, participación y vulnerabilidad, nos llevan a un ajuste de nosotros con el otro. Lo que estaba afuera de nosotros ahora está interiorizado. Interiormente, asumimos la forma, dinámica y significado del objeto contemplativo. Nosotros somos, en pocas palabras, transformados por la experiencia contemplativa de acuerdo con el objeto de contemplación.

Bildung (Educación como formación)

El individuo se desarrolla, o podríamos decir que es modelado, a través de la práctica contemplativa. En alemán, la palabra educación es *Erziehung* y *Bildung* al mismo tiempo. Este último proviene de la raíz que significa “formar”. Los orígenes del linaje de la educación como formación se remontan, por lo menos, hasta la antigua Grecia. El filósofo francés Pierre Hadot (1995-2002) escribe en su libro *¿Qué es la filosofía clásica?* acerca del filósofo antiguo: “el objetivo era desarrollar un hábito (*habitus*), o nueva capacidad de juzgar o criticar y transformar lo que significaba cambiar la manera que las personas vivían y veían al mundo” (p. 274). Simplicius preguntó, “¿qué lugar ocuparía el filósofo en la ciudad? La de un hombre escultor” (Hadot, p. 13). O, como Merleau-Ponty (1945-1962) señaló, necesitamos reaprender cómo ver al

mundo. En un ensayo sobre ciencia, Goethe (1988) declaró que “todo objeto bien contemplado crea un poder de percepción en nosotros” (p. 39). El importante trabajo de Parker Palmer también se centra en la educación como formación.

Comprensión

El resultado último del compromiso contemplativo, como se resumió aquí, es la formación interna el cual conduce a una comprensión que surge de una participación íntima en el curso de las cosas. En la epistemología budista, esto fue llamado percepción directa, y entre los griegos, nombrado *epítima* y fue contrastado con el raciocinio de inferencia, o *diánoia*. El conocimiento de este tipo es experimentado como una forma de ver o de apreciación directa en lugar de un raciocinio intelectual para lograr un resultado (Sloan, Sternberg y Davidson, 1995).

Para abreviar, debo dejar al margen el importante asunto sobre la confirmación de la comprensión por varios medios: experimental, consistencia lógica u otros métodos. En la filosofía de la ciencia, algunas veces se da la diferencia entre el contexto de descubrimiento y el contexto de prueba.

Finalmente, la reflexión contemplativa no es ni un análisis objetivo ni un ascetismo incorpóreo. En todas sus etapas transita una emoción franca y animada, un amor tranquilo que anima nuestro interés y nos mantiene atentos y comprometidos.

Para ayudarnos a comprender las características de la reflexión contemplativa, usaría dos citas, una de Goethe y la otra de Emerson. “Hay un empirismo delicado que se vuelve idéntico al objeto, convirtiéndose así en autentica teoría. Sin embargo, este aumento en nuestros poderes mentales pertenece a una época altamente evolucionada” (Goethe, 1988, p. 307).

En este pasaje, Goethe destaca muchas características del aprendizaje contemplativo. Primero, es un aprendizaje experimental. Lo que Goethe califica como “empirismo delicado” es también sumamente participativo; se “hace totalmente idéntico con el objeto. La teoría (de la raíz griega que significa “contemplar”) no es entendida aquí como razonamiento, como lógica deductiva, pero si, como yo ya lo había señalado, como una manera superior de ver, lo que

Goethe en otro lugar conceptuó “aperçu”². Nosotros logramos conocimiento por virtud de unión, no de separación, porque somos idénticos al objeto de nuestra atención. Goethe reconoce plenamente que tal conciencia no dividida está muy distante de donde nosotros empezamos, sin embargo, a la educación le interesa precisamente la mejora de nuestros poderes mentales en un trayecto que nos lleve de la ceguera a la visión. La segunda cita proviene del ensayo de Emerson (1844-1926) donde él escribió “*El poeta*”.

Esta comprensión, llamada imaginación, es una clase de vista muy amplia que no viene del estudio, sino del ser intelectual de donde y de lo que éste ve, compartiendo el camino, o circuito de cosas a través de formas, y así se hacen translúcidas a otros. El camino de las cosas es silencioso ¿Dejarán que un orador vaya con ellos? Ellos no permitirán a un espía; a un amante, un poeta, es la transcendencia de su propia naturaleza (a él sí lo dejarán). La condición de su nombramiento verdadero, en la parte que corresponde al poeta, es su renuncia al aura divino, que respira a través de formas, y acompañamiento. (pp. 278-279)

En el universo de Emerson, el poeta es un amante capaz de “renunciar a sí mismo” para que respire a través de las formas de la naturaleza. Él posee lo que llamo capacidad para la vulnerabilidad, la que conduce a la comprensión como una manera superior de ver llamada Imaginación. De esta manera, el poeta se distingue del espía, y la naturaleza, por consiguiente, le permite al poeta dar voz a su naturaleza: por designación verdadera.

Las reflexiones contemplativas son parte tanto de la ciencia como de las artes. El repentino descubrimiento de los cuaterniones del matemático Irlandés William Rowan Hamilton (es un paso más allá de los números imaginarios y complejos) mientras cruzaba el Puente Brougham en Dublín fue el fruto de un largo estado contemplativo de incertidumbre³. La comprensión se dio dentro de él como una corriente eléctrica, usando su propia metáfora. Fue un momento electrificante lo que provocó que se desviara rápidamente para grabar las identidades matemáticas claves en el barandal del puente; parecido a lo que le pasó al joven Werner Heisenberg con el descubrimiento de las relaciones de incertidumbre cuántica cuando enfermó en Dinamarca en 1927. Su compromiso apasionado con el tema de la complementariedad, se vio intensificada mientras visitaba a su padre espiritual, Niels Bohr, pero finalmente culminó

mientras Bohr estaba en unas vacaciones de esquí y Heisenberg estaba solo y con calentura. El tan mencionado contexto del descubrimiento es contemplativo y está lleno de pasión e incertidumbre continua. Las condiciones requeridas para esta comprensión intuitiva son totalmente diferentes de las pruebas objetivas y lógicas subsiguientes a ésta. El contexto de prueba, en efecto, requiere una evaluación cuidadosa de esta comprensión o reflexión contra la información de experimentos y la lógica matemática. Sin embargo, las nuevas reflexiones de la ciencia se dan como fruto de la gestación contemplativa, no de un análisis deductivo. Tal como Emerson (1903-1904) nos recordó:

Todo se vuelve poesía cuando miramos desde adentro... porque la poesía es ciencia, es el aliento del mismo espíritu por el cual la naturaleza vive. Y nunca ninguna ciencia se origina, si no es a través de una poética de la perspectiva. (p. 364)

AMOR Y COMPRENSIÓN

El historiador de arte Joel Upton y yo hemos enseñado, un par de veces, un curso en la Universidad de Amherst, en el que se pretende explorar las relaciones entre amor, conocimiento y contemplación. El curso es laico, con un poco de referencia sobre técnicas de meditación de tradiciones religiosas. Dos de las lecturas son de tradiciones espirituales occidentales (de la beguina Marguerite Porete [d. 1310] y del monje trapense Thomas Merton), pero el resto provienen de fuentes científicas, filosóficas, artísticas y literarias. El grupo del año pasado fue una clase compuesta de 30 estudiantes de primer grado con antecedentes raciales y económicos sorprendentemente diversos.⁴

Aprendimos por experiencia que debíamos empezar el curso con el polo del conocimiento. Para poder llevar a cabo discusiones concernientes al amor se requiere de sofisticación y confianza, el cual toma tiempo generar en clase. Adoptamos un ritmo más lento y más reflexivo para el curso. Las lecturas fueron cortas y eficaces, así que pedimos a los

estudiantes que se tomaran su tiempo al hacer las lecturas para que apreciaran su fuerza. Los ensayos fueron muy breves (de una página, excepto por el ensayo final, que fue más largo) y les solicitamos hacer tres borradores. Directa e indirectamente, les solicitamos que experimentaran los materiales de la clase, todo lo relacionado con las lecturas, las clases, nuestras múltiples conversaciones, las meditaciones y sus escritos. Paso a paso y uno por uno, les solicitamos convertirse cada vez más vulnerables al contenido del curso y participar enteramente. Paralelamente al material del curso, también hicimos que los estudiantes participaran en una serie de ejercicios contemplativos. Enfocaré el resto de mi presentación en estos ejercicios.

Debo mencionar que los estudiantes rápidamente se dieron cuenta de que el curso Amor y Comprensión no era como los demás cursos en Amherst College. Muchos estudiantes nos platicaron que en la preparatoria se habían vuelto cínicos respecto a la educación, que habían renunciado a ella. Ellos aprendieron a hacer lo que se les pida aún si no tenía relación con sus vidas, con sus preguntas más profundas o con sus más intensas añoranzas. Los mejores trabajos con grandes salarios eran los incentivos materiales para el mejor desempeño, y Amherst era solamente un medio para ese fin. Superarían el estándar que se les pusiera, no por interés propio, sino porque ellos son inteligentes y están capacitados para ello. Toma tiempo ganarse a los estudiantes y despertar en ellos la aspiración fundamental que todos tienen, la cual no tiene relación en ver a la educación primeramente como un instrumento para la adquisición de riqueza. Por el contrario, se trata de transformarse, desarrollarse, y convertirse en todo lo que ellos quisieran ser. En mis 25 años de experiencia en la enseñanza, Amor y Comprensión fue la práctica docente más gratificante que haya podido tener. Estoy especialmente agradecido con los estudiantes que confiaron en nosotros para que los guiáramos en nuevos territorios y experiencias.

La primera clase

En la primera sesión les dijimos lo siguiente: “este es el primer día de su nueva vida. Ustedes han ingresado a la Universidad de Amherst, ustedes ya no están en casa, ¿qué harán con la apreciable

vida que empiezan hoy?” Después repartimos pasajes de “Walden” de Henry David Thoreau (1854-1966) y “la Gravedad y Armonía” de Simone Weil. (1947-1987):

Me fui a los bosques porque deseaba vivir deliberadamente, enfrentar solo los hechos esenciales de la vida, y ver si podía no aprender lo que ella tenía que enseñarme, en lugar de que, al morir, me diese cuenta de que no había vivido. (p.61)

Así pues se le presenta a los estudiantes un tema inicial del curso: ¿Qué significa ir al bosque? Thoreau buscó un lugar apartado para vivir deliberadamente y con atención plena. Nosotros lo haremos de la misma manera, estableciendo momentos apartados para estar deliberadamente en atención plena y para que podamos aprender también a distinguir los hechos esenciales de la vida. Con la prisa en nuestras vidas, algunas veces las dejamos pasar. Nosotros aprenderemos con nuestro silencio y reflexión, de manera paciente y tranquila. En la descripción de Thoreau (1854-1966) sobre la mañana, nosotros conocemos un tema esencial del curso: volverse conscientes:

Son millones los que se despiertan lo suficiente para desempeñar tareas físicas, pero solo uno de un millón, está lo suficientemente despierto para realizar un trabajo intelectual eficaz, y tan solo uno de cien millones lo está para una existencia poética o divina. Estar despierto es estar vivo. Hasta ahora, no he encontrado un hombre que estuviese lo suficientemente despierto. En tal caso, ¿cómo habría podido mirarlo de frente? (pp. 60-61)

Los estudiantes habían sido admitidos en Amherst porque demostraron capacidades de esfuerzo intelectual, ¿y qué quedó? Al finalizar la hora muchos deseaban despertar a una vida divina o poética, y estar verdaderamente vivos.

Simone Weil (1947-1987) escribió sobre la omnipresente fuerza de gravedad, la cual está donde sea y ordena todas las cosas, excepto la armonía. Esta sola se define como el alcance de la gravedad, pero requiere de condiciones especiales para aparecer. Weil dice, “la armonía llena espacios, pero únicamente puede entrar donde hay un vacío para recibirla” (p.55). Simone Weil evoca la importancia poderosa del silencio, la vacuidad, la transparencia, lo vacío. La meditación

nos ayuda a entrar al espacio del silencio y promover la claridad donde la armonía puede aparecer.

De forma natural, hicimos que nuestra conversación con los estudiantes nos llevara a una serie de diapositivas finales mostrando un jardín Zen y un estanque con ondas en el agua: Terminamos la clase con el haiku de Basho (1686-1967) y su primer ejercicio de meditación de cinco minutos de silencio.

En el viejo estanque,
el salto de una rana,
sonido del agua.

Los estudiantes tenían que continuar el ejercicio de silencio por sí mismos. Les asignamos un ensayo de una página de descripción pura sobre las etapas y la experiencia de meditar en silencio. Sin fantasías de imaginación o análisis sofisticado, científico o filosófico—únicamente con prosa simple, atenta, deliberada y descriptiva.

Atención continua

El segundo ejercicio es sobre la atención continua y el cultivo de lo que se denomina imagen residual (o fantasma). Cualquier objeto basta para realizarlo, pero utilizando el sonido de una campana. La meditación tiene tres fases que nosotros desarrollamos, y una cuarta, que es la armonía:

- 1) Haz sonar la campana tres veces. Escucha atentamente su forma y timbre.
- 2) Aún después de que el sonido de la campana se haya ido al silencio exterior, nosotros conservamos la memoria del sonido de la campana. Nosotros podemos hacer resonar la campana interiormente. Hazlo. Escucha su resonancia interior una y otra vez.
- 3) La tercera fase es la del silencio. Esta permite a la memoria del sonido de la campana desvanecerse, soltando todo el sonido, y abriéndose ampliamente a la atención. El modo

apropiado para este estado es representado maravillosamente en el Tao Te Ching (El libro del Camino y la virtud) (c. 500 a.C. / 1988) de Lao-tsu.

El Maestro no busca la realización.

No buscando, no esperando,

ella está presente y puede dar la bienvenida a todas las cosas (p. 15).

4) La cuarta fase no es desarrollada por nosotros, pero se puede presenciar en el espacio de silencio de manera preparada y continua. En la descripción del Buddhaghosa (d.C. 350/1975, pp.143-204), lo que se llamó diez *kasinas* o recursos (tierra, agua, aire, fuego, cuatro colores...), ésta es llamada la fase de imagen residual. Durante esta fase, el aspecto interno del sonido de la campana u otras experiencias sensoriales usadas de la misma manera, se incrementan en el silencio y el vacío.

Manteniendo la apertura

La atención verdadera y única es, por definición, ajena a todo lo que se encuentre fuera del campo de atención. La reflexión contemplativa va de la atención continua a la enfocada y de ahí a la atención abierta. Cuando liberamos el sonido de la campana, ya nos estamos acercando a la práctica de esta etapa. Sin embargo, puede volverse la característica principal del ejercicio utilizando la relación entre las cosas como centro de atención. Cualquier comparación sirve, pero la que nosotros hemos utilizado es el ejercicio de escala de valores más sencillo y común para el entrenamiento artístico. Al proporcionar a los estudiantes papeles, pinceles y pinturas de acrílico en blanco y negro, les pedimos hacer una secuencia graduada de cuadros grises que van cambiando uniformemente de blanco al negro.

Usamos éste y otros ejercicios de comparación para cultivar un sentido de relación y que nosotros vemos como la primera característica de la *cognición* contemplativa. Uno va de estados individuales de conciencia a la percepción directa de diferencias y similitudes. Este es un

momento clave. Si intentamos unir la contemplación con el conocimiento, con *veritas*, entonces debemos comprender la práctica contemplativa, desde los beneficios psicológicos y en salud a través de la meditación (los cuales son importante), hasta sus beneficios cognitivos.

Manteniendo la contradicción

La cuarta etapa de la reflexión contemplativa resultó ser especialmente desafiante para nuestros brillantes estudiantes de Amherst. Cuando ellos se enfrentan a un problema, quieren resolverlo. Si encuentran una contradicción, la resuelven. La realidad con frecuencia se resiste a este enfoque, y por buenas razones.

Les enseñé acerca de la dualidad onda-partícula en física, y Joel les habló sobre la tensión artística producida por elementos antagonistas en excelentes trabajos de arte. Los enviamos, en binas, al museo de arte para observar retratos particulares que tienen el extraño hábito de devolver la mirada. Pusimos a un estudiante en un lado de la galería, y al otro, en el lado opuesto. La pintura observaba a ambos; miraba hacia dos direcciones simultáneamente, algo imposible. En el siglo XV, el cardenal Nicolás de Cusa (1453-1960), quien recomendó este ejercicio a sus monjes, llamó a este fenómeno y a otros similares una coincidencia de opuestos. Pensar sobre la contradicción, mantenerla y en lugar de resolverla, prolongarla— manteniendo la contradicción.

Sin embargo, la gran importancia de cultivar una conciencia que pueda mantener la contradicción no era entendida por nuestros estudiantes hasta que surgió el tema durante una de nuestras informales conversaciones nocturnas. Muchos de nuestros estudiantes, de diferentes razas y etnias, empezaron a platicar acerca de la complejidad irreconciliable de sus vidas y que les ha causado gran incertidumbre y sufrimiento por años. Fueran ellos de origen chino o estadounidense, ¿cómo se relacionaba la casa haitiana que ellos tuvieron que dejar (llena de vida, donde se habla criollo y se practica una profunda religiosidad) con la vida en campus de Amherst que requiere una mente inmaculada y a la vez una vida escandalosa? ¿Estaban traicionando su linaje? ¿Necesitaban decidirse entre una de sus identidades contradictorias? ¿Cómo podrían hacerlo? Sus vidas requerían sostener esta contradicción enorme. Como el escritor franco-libanés AminMaalouf (2003) lo ha expresado, es, precisamente, a través de las irreconciliables complejidades de nuestras vidas que nuestra identidad emerge. Cuando negamos esa

complejidad, la sociedad se descompone rápidamente entre facciones étnicas y religiosas que compiten por dominar.

Desarrollando amor propio

Únicamente cuando alcanzamos este momento crucial en clase, porque la vida y arquitectura del amor son intensificadas por contradicciones imposibles, es cuando estuvimos listos para hablar explícitamente de amor. Anhelamos estar con la amada sin dañarla o afectarla en lo más mínimo. Estudiamos a los trovadores y sus cantos, que repetidamente entonan sobre la naturaleza contradictoria del amor, como estas líneas de Arnaut Daniel (s.f.) del siglo XIII muestran:

Nunca lo sostuve, pero me detiene.
todo el tiempo en su fianza, Amor,
y me alegra de ira, tonto de sabiduría
como alguien que nunca puede defenderse,
porque el que ama bien no puede defenderse.

El amor es a la vez doloroso y alegre, una “dulce pena”. El amor puede empezar con nosotros mismos, aceptando e incluso llenando de alegría los elementos contradictorios de los que estamos compuestos ¿Soy un científico, un poeta o un buscador espiritual? Sí, todos ellos. Las estructuras de nuestras instituciones de educación superior ocultan esta complejidad. En el mejor de los casos, las instituciones luchan por capturarla a través de conversaciones interdisciplinarias entre representantes de diferentes disciplinas. Estas con frecuencia terminan siendo negociaciones entre naciones o grupos étnicos de las Naciones Unidas. Se requiere más, mucho más, si vamos a integrar estos diversos elementos sin disolverlos, y empieza fomentando las contradicciones en nosotros mismos. Ello puede darse únicamente si amamos las contradicciones y, por lo tanto, el amor a nosotros mismos.

Desarrollando amor al prójimo

La bien conocida meditación budista de la bondad amorosa permite que alguien amplifique gradualmente el círculo de nuestra atención compasiva y cariñosa. Se empieza por uno mismo, después con alguien más cercano (un amigo, pariente o esposo) deseándoles paz, felicidad y bienestar. Posteriormente, ampliamos más el círculo de nuestra atención cariñosa para incluir aquellos que no conocemos bien, deseando para ellos, igualmente, paz, felicidad y bienestar. Y finalmente, escogemos a alguien que sea problemático y difícil en nuestra vida. Incluso para ellos queremos lo mismo.

Para cuando realizamos este ejercicio, leemos el Simposio de Platón, su maravilloso discurso del amor. El amor, como fue enseñado a Sócrates por Diotima, no se dirige únicamente hacia otras personas, sino también hacia la belleza en la naturaleza y hacia las grandes instituciones que representan nuestros más grandes ideales. A fin de cuentas, amamos las formas ideales que están reflejadas en todas partes a través de la belleza en las hermosas creaciones humanas y naturales. La “escala del amor”, sin embargo, no únicamente lleva al terreno de las formas puras, sino que también desciende a lo rutinario. En las páginas finales del diálogo, el alcoholico Alcibiades describe su genuino amor por Sócrates, y se atreve a platicar de la vida noble de su maestro. Estas son palabras que testifican sobre una vida vivida en el amor hacia sus estudiantes, hacia sus compañeros atenienses y hacia los eternos ideales de verdad, belleza y bondad, un amor que fue remunerado con una copa de veneno.

Amando los actos de amor

Una figura importante en nuestro curso sobre este tema, es la beguina Marguerite Porete quien murió alrededor del año 1310. En su libro, *El espejo de las almas simples*, Porete (1290-1993), usó el nuevo lenguaje de *fin amor* que cantaban los trovadores en el antiguo provenzal para describir su *amor de loing*, su “*amor de lejos*”. En su caso, su amor distante no era un compañero terrenal sino Dios. Debido a la intensidad de su amor hacia su ser amado, ella se dio

cuenta que la acción moral verdadera no era guiada por las reglas de lo que ella llamó “la iglesia de lo pequeño”, sino por la gran iglesia del amor. En lugar de las virtudes teologales, de las que ella se liberó, propuso guiarse solamente por el amor, citando a San Agustín de Hipona (d.C.16-2004): “Ama y haz lo que quieras”. Su adhesión al amor como la guía verdadera para nuestros actos, le originó conflictos con ciertos obispos en la iglesia católica de Francia. Como resultado ella fue arrestada, encarcelada, y juzgada por la inquisición de París. Ella se negó a abjurar de su amor y puntos de vista y fue entonces condenada a morir quemada por “la herejía del espíritu libre”. En su ejecución, todos lloraron cuando vieron con qué grande nobleza enfrentó su muerte.

Los estudiantes al conocer la vida de Porete, se conmueven, profundamente, por su valentía y su trágica vida. Así, les pedimos meditar sobre la frase de Agustín “Ama y haz lo que quieras”, que era el centro de vida de Porete. También, les pedimos escribir sobre cómo el amor y la reflexión están aquí produciendo una forma de conocimiento contemplativo. Después de todo, Marguerite Porete sabía algo que sin duda le permitió soportar silenciosamente y con seguridad ante más grandes autoridades de la inquisición de París sin flaquear: el amor cariñoso le concedió una comprensión o contemplación (*aperçū*) por el que ella estaba dispuesta a morir. De otro modo hubiera sido traicionar a su amado.

Reinventando tu educación

La tarea final para nuestros estudiantes fue que pensarán en una versión nueva de su educación universitaria en Amherst, teniendo en cuenta el amor y la comprensión. Ellos ya habían estudiado a Kepler y Rembrandt; habían leído a Oliver Sacks, Niels Bohrs, Bárbara McClintock, Albert Einstein, y Werner Heisenberg. Los estudiantes, previamente, habían leído y reflexionado sobre el amor con los trovadores, Merton, Rilke, T. S. Eliot y Platón. Además, ya habían meditado enfocándose en silencio, atención, apertura, contradicción, amor propio, amor al prójimo y amor a las acciones. Así que, les pedimos que reflexionaran sobre si ¿la educación (su educación) debería encauzarse con estas perspectivas? Este fue su ensayo final: rediseñar su educación en Amherst, tomando en cuenta el amor y la reflexión, visualizando la relación entre el amor y el conocimiento.

Upton y yo finalizamos Amor y Comprensión con una visualización que nos sugirieron un par de estudiantes la primera vez que ofrecimos el curso. En términos sencillos, la metáfora visual es un camino o entrada compuesta de dos postes con un dintel entre éstos. Los dos postes son una metáfora visual de las dos partes del curso: amor y comprensión. Como nuestros estudiantes acertadamente reconocieron, el amor puede rápidamente degradarse al deseo, así como la comprensión también puede ser mero razonamiento instrumental. Sin embargo, Eros puede ser enriquecido y convertirse el dintel del amor, lo cual parece implicar que la ampliación de la comprensión se convierte en amor también; un conocimiento que es también amoroso es una epistemología del amor.

De esta manera, como resultado, la tarea encomendada por Rilke (1975), aprendiendo amar, es también la labor de aprender a *conocer* en su sentido más pleno. Karl Jaspers (1957-1974) citó a Nicolás de Cusa con respecto a la forma más elevada del conocimiento humano: “el conocimiento es aquí idéntico al amor y el amor idéntico al conocimiento” (p.51). Una epistemología del amor no es un camino de la razón hacia el sentimiento. La academia no tiene nada que temer a la reflexión contemplativa, en realidad, tal reflexión ya forma parte en cierta medida de un currículo oculto que educa para el descubrimiento, la creatividad y la conciencia social.

Los educadores contemplativos, como tal, creo que estamos comprometidos con un importante proyecto, una gran tradición. El proyecto de la filosofía antigua tenía como objetivos vivir una vida correcta, personificar la virtud y no únicamente legislarla, generar creatividad y capacidades para la reflexión, no únicamente memorizar fórmulas y trabajos de arte. Hadot (1995-2002) señaló que la educación antigua era “un curso de entrenamiento que convertía simultáneamente a los hombres en contemplativos y seres de acción, el conocimiento y la virtud mutuamente se implican” (p. 90).

Rajiv (seudónimo), en su ensayo final de Amor y Comprensión, confesó que ahora estaba inseguro de lo que le diría a sus padres acerca de sus planes de carrera. Su madre era física nuclear y su padre, neurocirujano. Ellos esperaban que él obtuviera un buen trabajo con un buen salario inmediatamente después de su graduación, y previo al curso, él había cumplido con las expectativas de sus padres. En su ensayo final, él escribió, “¿cómo les digo ahora que lo único que quiero ser en la vida es alguien que ama?” Dado sus formidables talentos, estoy seguro de que Rajiv logrará éxito en el exterior, pero espero que recuerde vivir deliberadamente, cultivar

silencio, atención, una conciencia racional, e incluso sostener las contradicciones. Entonces será vulnerable y participará de los misterios que se encuentran en su entorno. Él pasará de ser un espía a un ser que ama y acepta la naturaleza. En el proceso, se reformará, dando forma a sus órganos para la cognición, para un tipo de visión superior que pueda constituir teorías verdaderas. Él puede guiar su vida con la ética asociada con esta epistemología, porque a este nivel más alto de contemplación profunda, conocimiento y amor son uno mismo, sus acciones serán virtuosas y sus palabras verdaderas. En cierta medida, él habrá logrado la mejor y más difícil tarea de todas, para la cual toda nuestra vida nos prepara: aprender a amar.

NOTAS

1. Ver también P. Palmer (1983). *Saber cómo somos conocidos*, cap. 1 y 2. San Francisco: Harper.
2. Goethe en una carta dirigida a Soret el 30 de diciembre de 1823, mencionada por Rike Wankmüller, *Goethes Schriften* (vol. 13, p. 616). Hamburger Ausgabe, Munich, Alemania: Verlag C. H. Beck. “En ciencia, sin embargo, el arreglo es nulo, y toda eficacia cae en el aperçu.”
3. “Todas las mañanas al principio del ya mencionado mes (octubre), antes del desayuno, tu (entonces) hermano menor William Edwin y tú, solían preguntarme, „Bien, papá ¿Puedes multiplicar triples“? Donde me veía obligado a responder tristemente un no con la cabeza: ‘No, únicamente puedo sumar y restar.’ Pero dieciséis días después del mismo mes (era un lunes, y un día de consejo en la Real Academia Irlandesa) yo estaba entrando para atender y presidir y tu madre me acompañaba, a lo largo del Canal Real, que ella tal vez hubiera conducido, y aunque ella habló conmigo muy poco, una corriente de ideas se me vinieron a la mente, y me dejaron como resultado al menos, poco que decir esa importancia que sentí al mismo tiempo. Un circuito eléctrico parecía aproximarse, y una chispa salió, el heraldo (como yo preví, inmediatamente) de muchos largos años de presentar definitivamente pensamiento y trabajo recto, permitido por mí, y en todos los eventos y parte de otros, si se me hubiera permitido vivir lo suficientemente con claridad para comunicar el descubrimiento. Ni hubiera podido resistir el impulso (no filosófico como lo pudo haber sido) para corar con un cuchillo sobre una piedra del Puente Brougham, conforme pasamos este, la fórmula fundamental con los símbolos, i, j, k ; concretamente, $i^2 = j^2 = k^2 = ijk = -1$ el cual contiene la solución del problema.” La carta de Hamilton’s: <http://www.maths.tcd.ie/pub/HistMath/People/Hamilton/Letters/BroomeBridge.html>.
4. Para más información sobre el curso, ver el artículo “*Amor y Comprensión*” en Amherst Magazine y las páginas de internet relacionadas (<http://www.amherst.edu/magazine/Issues/04spring/>). También leer mi artículo: Zajonc, A. (2003). *Espiritualidad en educación superior: Superando la división*. *Educación Liberal*, 89, 50-58.

Arthur Zajonc es un profesor de física en la universidad Amherst, donde ha enseñado desde 1978. Recibió su doctorado en física en la Universidad de Michigan, seguido por una beca de postdoctorado de 2 años en el Instituto de Unión por el Laboratorio de Astrofísica en Boulder, Colorado. Ha sido profesor visitante y científico investigador en la Escuela Normal Superior en París, el Max Planck Instituto para la Óptica Cuántica, la Universidad de Rochester, y la Universidad de Hannover. Zajonc también ha sido un profesor brillante en la Universidad de Innsbruck en Australia. Su investigación ha incluido estudios en la colisión de los átomos electrones, transferencias radioactivas, violación de paridad en átomos, los fundamentos experimentales de la física cuántica y la relación entre las ciencias y humanidades. Además, ha escrito ampliamente sobre la ciencia de Goethe. Es autor de *Atrapar la Claridad*, coautor de *El Desafío de la Cuántica* y coeditor del *Estilo de Ciencia de Goethe*. Zajonc ha trabajado como coordinador científico de diálogos sobre la Mente y la Vida con H. H. el Dalai Lama. Los diálogos de 1997 y 2003 están en los libros *La Nueva Física y Cosmología: Diálogos con el Dalai Lama* y *el Dalai Lama en el Instituto de Tecnología de Massachusetts*. Igualmente, Zajonc es director del programa académico del Centro para la Mente Contemplativa en la Sociedad.

7 ORIGINAL ARTICLE

Love and Knowledge: Recovering the Heart of Learning Through Contemplation

ARTHUR ZAJONC

Amherst College

*The role of contemplative practice in adult education has a long history if one includes traditional monastic education in Asia and the West. Its use in American higher education is, however, more recent and more limited. Nonetheless, on the basis of evidence from surveys and conferences, a significant community of teachers exists at all levels of higher education, from community colleges to research universities, who are using a wide range of contemplative practices as part of their classroom pedagogy. In addition to existing well-developed pedagogical and curricular methods that school critical reasoning, critical reading and writing, and quantitative analysis, this article argues that we also require a pedagogy that attends to the development of reflective, contemplative, affective, and ethical capacities in our students. The significance of these is at least as great as the development of critical capacities in students. The rationale for the inclusion of contemplative modalities is articulated within this context. On the basis of considerable experience in teaching at Amherst College, I present an “epistemology of love,” which emphasizes a form of inquiry that supports close engagement and leads to student transformation and insight. This approach to knowing is implemented in the Amherst College first-year course, *Eros and Insight*. It includes a specific sequence of contemplative exercises that are practiced by students and integrated with more conventional course content drawn from the arts and sciences. Our experience shows that students deeply appreciate the shift from conventional coursework to a more experiential, transformative, and reflective pedagogy.*

Preventing conflicts is the work of politics;
establishing peace is the work of education.

—Maria Montessori, 1972, p. 30

It is a privilege to add my thoughts to those that we have already heard. Jon Kabat Zinn spoke about the unification of knowing through contemplation, reminding us both how available mindfulness is and how difficult it can be

Teachers College Record Volume 108, Number 9, September 2006, pp. 1742–1759
Copyright © by Teachers College, Columbia University
0161-4681

to bring full awareness to the entirety of life. Marilyn Nelson told us the story of teaching silence to those whose lives take them into war and conflict. We remember the young officer who pretended to be listening to music on his headphones, when really all he was listening to was silence. We have participated in discussions and workshops suggesting that contemplative practices can be an important pedagogical method for ourselves and our students. And we have heard how important it can be to establish peace in ourselves in order to foster and maintain peace in the world. I am only sorry that I have not had the opportunity to speak with all of you, to learn from you what you are doing with contemplation, what your questions are, and what you are planning. To this rich brew of experience and insight, I would like to add another element, one that is extremely difficult to speak of within the academy, yet which I feel is central to its work—namely, the relationship between knowledge (which we excel at) and love (which we neglect).

First, a personal remark: As a scientist, any attempt to relate knowledge to love feels like an enormous breach of etiquette; it is very bad form, especially so in a public setting such as this. But I have come to conclude that the fear I have felt when broaching this topic was based on particular institutional forms and forces that have ultimately worked against our fundamental human interests. So please join me in setting aside your suspicions and hesitations, and explore with me the possible relationship between knowledge, love, and contemplation.

If I were to ask what should be at the center of our teaching and our students' learning, how would you respond? Of the many tasks that we as educators take up, what, in your view, is the most important task of all? What is our greatest hope for the young people we teach? In his letters to the young poet Franz Kappus, Rainer Maria Rilke (1904/1954) answered unequivocally.

To take love seriously and to bear and to learn it like a task, this is what [young] people need. . . . For one human being to love another, that is perhaps the most difficult of all our tasks, the ultimate, the last test and proof, the work for which all other work is but a preparation. For this reason young people, who are beginners in everything, cannot yet know love, they have to learn it. With their whole being, with all their forces, gathered close about their lonely, timid, upward-beating heart, they must learn to love. (p. 41)

Need I say it? The curricula offered by our institutions of higher education have largely neglected this central, if profoundly difficult, task of learning to love, which is also the task of learning to live in true peace and harmony with others and with nature.

We are well-practiced at educating the mind for critical reasoning, critical writing, and critical speaking, and for scientific and quantitative analysis. But is this sufficient? In a world beset with conflicts, internal and external, isn't it of equal if not greater importance to balance the sharpening of our intellects with the systematic cultivation of our hearts? Do not the issues of social justice, the environment, and peace education all demand greater attention and a more central place in our universities and colleges? Yes, certainly.

Yet although this is undoubtedly true, my presentation will not address the issue of balancing intellectual accomplishment with good works. Rather, what I would like to suggest is that knowing itself remains partial and deformed if we do not develop and practice an epistemology of love instead of an epistemology of separation. Harvard's motto is *Veritas*, or Truth. Knowing is, in this view, the central project of higher education. I maintain, however, that truth itself—*veritas* itself—eludes us if we bring to the world and to each other an epistemology of separation only. Our conventional epistemology hands us a dangerous counterfeit in truth's place, one that may pass for truth but in fact is partial and impoverished.

In a 1993 talk at Berea College, Parker Palmer noted that "every way of knowing becomes a way of living, every epistemology becomes an ethic."¹ He argued that the current epistemology has spawned an associated ethic of violence. Surely, science has brought enormous advances, but we cannot turn away from the central fact that the modern emphasis on objectification predisposes us to an instrumental and manipulative way of being in the world. As Parker suggested in Berea, our way of knowing does, indeed, grow into a way of living. The implications of this position are large. Although I am emphatically not calling for a rollback of science, I am calling for resituating it within a greater vision of what knowing and living are really all about. That reimagination of knowing will have deep consequences for education, consequences that give a prominent place to contemplative pedagogies. Indeed, I hope to convince you that contemplative practice can become contemplative inquiry, which *is* the practice of an epistemology of love. Such contemplative inquiry not only yields insight (*veritas*) but also transforms the knower through his or her intimate (one could say loving) participation in the subject of one's contemplative attention. Contemplative education is transformative education. Although Jack Mezirow's (2000) foundational research here at Teachers College on transformative education was concerned with critical reflection, not meditation, I see his work and that of such theorists as Robert Kegan (1982, 1994) as offering a highly appropriate academic lineage within which to understand contemplative pedagogies.

In the remainder of my time, I first propose to sketch the contours of an epistemology of intimacy and participation—that is, an epistemology of

love—that extends scientific and scholarly inquiry in ways that need not be viewed as problematic to academic teaching or to our research disciplines. I would then like to describe some of the main elements of a course I have taught with an art historian, Joel Upton, at Amherst College. Entitled *Eros and Insight*, it attempts to embody something of this way of knowing and to take up the challenge that Rilke presented to us all: the challenge of learning to love.

AN EPISTEMOLOGY OF LOVE

Ironically, I believe that we first need to recognize and accept as part of our existential reality the separation or solitude that we experience. We do, indeed, feel disconnected from each other and also from the natural world around us. The spiritual philosopher Rudolf Steiner (1916/1995) thought that *Einsamkeit*, or solitude, was the “main characteristic of our age.” (p. 94) His contemporary Rilke (1904/1954) put it more forcefully.

To speak of solitude again, it becomes always clearer that this is at bottom not something that one can take or leave. We *are* solitary. We may delude ourselves and act as though this were not so. That is all. But how much better it is to realize that we are so, yes, even to begin by assuming it. (p. 50)

I view the scientific stance as a symptom of this more general psychological and spiritual malaise. Solitude is the mirror side or inevitable correlate of an increasingly strong development of self and personal identity. As individuals separate from ethnic groups and as women gradually become authentic individuals, so also does the force and comfort of the collective diminish. Our search for individual identity has the accompanying downside that we disidentify with other people, groups, and nature.

Although much has been gained through this process of individuation, achievements that we should not lose, if left to go on indefinitely, we logically end up with a collection of selfish monads. I am convinced that the countervailing force to such fragmentation is not mutual self-interest or rational economic action that maximizes utility (as economists would have it); rather, I believe that genuine empathetic relationships can be and are established between and among us. Increasingly, these connections are not between tribes or ethnic and religious groups; they are between individuals. Healthy human relationships do not happen automatically; each of us must cultivate them intentionally. Nothing in this realm is given for free.

The same logic holds true for our relationship to the environment. We no longer grow up grooming horses and harnessing draft animals on the farm. In New York City, you can go for days without ever walking on the earth. Our relationship to nature must likewise be intentional. The practice

of contemplation is an important part of that intentional stance, one that can lead to sustained empathetic relationships.

Having made the intentional turn from isolation to empathetic connection, we are prepared for a contemplative way of knowing, one whose relationship to love will, I think, grow increasingly obvious. What are the features or stages of contemplative inquiry?

Respect

When approaching the object of our contemplative attention, we do so with respect and restraint. Concerning the relationship to the beloved, Rilke (1904/1975) maintained that “a togetherness between two people is an impossibility” (p. 28). Instead of an easy fusion with the beloved, Rilke (1904/1954) insisted that “love consists in this, that two solitudes protect and border and salute each other” (p. 45). Likewise, I feel that the first stage of contemplative inquiry is to respect the integrity of the other, to stand guard over its nature, over its solitude, whether the other is a poem, a novel, a phenomenon of nature, or the person sitting before us. We need to allow it to speak its truth without our projection or correction.

Gentleness

Contemplative inquiry is gentle or delicate. In his own scientific investigations, Goethe (1988) sought to practice what he called a “gentle empiricism (*zarte Empirie*)” (p. 307). If we wish to approach the object of our attention without distorting it, then we must be gentle. By contrast, the empiricism of Francis Bacon spoke of extracting nature’s secrets under extreme conditions, putting her to the rack.

Intimacy

Conventional science distances itself from nature and, to use Erwin Schrödinger’s (1956/1967) term, *objectifies* nature. Ideally, science disengages itself from phenomena for the sake of objectivity. Contemplative inquiry, by contrast, approaches the phenomenon, delicately and respectfully, but it does nonetheless seek to become intimate with that to which it attends. One can still retain clarity and balanced judgment close up if we remember to exercise restraint and gentleness.

Participation

Gentle intimacy leads to participation by the contemplative inquirer in the unfolding phenomenon before one. Outer characteristics invite us to go

deeper. We move and feel with the natural phenomenon, text, painting, or person before us, living out of ourselves and into the other. Respectfully and delicately, in meditation we join with the other, while maintaining full awareness and clarity of mind. In other words, contemplative inquiry is experientially centered in the other, not in ourselves. Our usual preoccupations, fears, and cravings work against authentic participation.

Vulnerability

In order to move with the other, to be gentle in the sense meant here, to participate the other truly, we must be confident enough to be vulnerable, secure enough to resign ourselves to the course of things. A dominating arrogance will not serve. We must learn to be comfortable with *not* knowing, with ambiguity and uncertainty. Only from what may appear to be weakness and ignorance can the new and unknown arise.

Transformation

The last two, participation and vulnerability, lead to a patterning of ourselves on the other. What was outside us is now internalized. Inwardly we assume the shape, dynamic, and meaning of the contemplative object. We are, in a word, transformed by contemplative experience in accord with the object of contemplation.

Bildung—Education as formation

The individual develops, or we could say is sculpted, through contemplative practice. In German, education is both *Erziehung* and *Bildung*. The latter stems from the root meaning “to form.” The lineage of education as formation dates back at least as far as the Greeks. In his book *What Is Ancient Philosophy?* the French philosopher Pierre Hadot (1995/2002) writes of the ancient philosopher, “the goal was to develop a *habitus*, or new capacity to judge or criticize, and to transform—that is, to change people’s way of living and seeing the world” (p. 274). Simplicius asked, “What place shall the philosopher occupy in the city? That of a sculptor of men” (Hadot, p. xiii). Or, as Merleau-Ponty (1945/1962) put it, we need to relearn how to see the world. In an essay on science, Goethe (1988) declared that “every object well-contemplated creates an organ of perception in us” (p. 39). Parker Palmer’s important work also centers on education as formation.

Insight

The ultimate result of contemplative engagement as outlined here is organ formation, which leads to insight born of an intimate participation in the course of things. In the Buddhist epistemology, this was called *direct perception*, and among the Greeks, it was called *episteme* and was contrasted with inferential reasoning, or *dianoia*. Knowing of this type is experienced as a kind of seeing or direct apprehension rather than as an intellectual reasoning to a result (Sloan, 1993; Sternberg & Davidson, 1995).

In the interest of time, I must leave aside the important issue concerning the confirmation of insight by various means: experimental, logical consistency, or other methods. In philosophy of science, this is sometimes termed the difference between the context of discovery and the context of proof.

Finally, contemplative inquiry is neither dispassionate analysis nor disembodied asceticism. Throughout all its stages there moves a lively, open excitement, a calm Eros that animates our interest and keeps us attentive and engaged.

To help us understand the features of contemplative inquiry, I would like to use two citations, one from Goethe (1988), a second from Emerson.

There is a delicate empiricism which makes itself utterly identical with the object, thereby becoming true theory. But this enhancement of our mental powers belongs to a highly evolved age. (p. 307)

In this passage, Goethe highlights for us several features of contemplative learning. First, it is experiential learning. What Goethe terms a “delicate empiricism” is also deeply participatory; it makes “itself utterly identical with the object.” Theory (from the Greek root meaning “to behold”) is not understood here as ratiocination, as deductive logic, but as I have already stated, as a high form of seeing, what Goethe elsewhere terms “*aperçu*.”² We know by virtue of connection, not disconnection, because we are identical with the object of our attention. Goethe fully recognizes that such nondual awareness is far distant from where we begin, but education is concerned with precisely the enhancement of our mental powers in this direction, with the journey from blindness to seeing.

The second citation comes from Emerson’s (1844/1926,) essay “The Poet,” in which he wrote,

This insight, which expresses itself by what is called Imagination, is a very high sort of seeing, which does not come by study, but by the

intellect being where and what it sees, by sharing the path, or circuit of things through forms, and so making them translucid to others. The path of things is silent. Will they suffer a speaker to go with them? A spy they will not suffer; a lover, a poet, is the transcendency of their own nature—him they will suffer. The condition of true naming, on the poet's part, is his resigning himself to the divine aura which breathes through forms, and accompanying that. (pp. 278–279)

In Emerson's universe, the poet is a lover who is capable of "resigning himself" to that which breathes through the forms of nature. He possesses what I have called the capacity for vulnerability, which leads to insight as a high form of seeing called Imagination. In this way, the poet distinguishes himself from the spy, and nature consequently permits the poet to give voice to her nature: true naming.

Contemplative insights are as much a part of science as the arts. The Irish mathematician William Rowan Hamilton's sudden discovery of *quaternions* (which are a step beyond imaginary and complex numbers) while walking across the Brougham Bridge in Dublin was the fruit of long contemplative uncertainty.³ The insight passed into him like an electric current, to use his own metaphor. It was an electrifying moment causing him to quickly turn aside and carve the key mathematical identities into the bridge railing—likewise with the young Werner Heisenberg's discovery of the quantum uncertainty relations in 1927 while ill in Denmark. His passionate engagement with the theme of complementarity intensified while visiting his spiritual father Niels Bohr, but it finally culminated while Bohr was on a skiing vacation and Heisenberg was alone and feverish. The so-called context of discovery is a contemplative context that is full of passion and sustained uncertainty. The conditions required for intuitive insight are quite different from the subsequent dispassionate, logical testing of it. The "context of proof" does indeed require careful assessment of insights against the data of experiments and the logic of mathematics. But the new insights of science enter as the fruit of contemplative gestation, not deductive analysis. As Emerson (1903–1904) reminded us, "All becomes poetry when we look from within . . . because poetry is science, is the breath of the same spirit by which nature lives. And never did any science originate, but by a poetic perception" (p. 364).

EROS AND INSIGHT

The art historian Joel Upton and I have twice taught a course at Amherst College that attempts to explore the relations between love, knowledge, and contemplation. The course is secular, with little reference to techniques of

meditation that are taken from religious tradition. Two of the readings are from the Western spiritual traditions (the beguine Marguerite Porete [d. 1310] and the Trappist monk Thomas Merton), but the remainder are from scientific, philosophic, artistic, and literary sources. Last year's group was a class of 30 first-year students from surprisingly diverse backgrounds, racially and economically.⁴

We learned from experience to start with the knowledge pole of the course. Discussions concerning love require trust and sophistication, both of which take time to engender in a class. We adopted a slower, more reflective pace for the course. Readings were short and powerful; we asked students to spend time with them and appreciate their force. Papers were very brief—one page, except for the final paper, which was longer—and we required the students to turn in three drafts. Directly and indirectly, we asked them to live the class materials, all of it: the readings, the lectures, our many conversations, the meditations, and their writing. Step by step and one by one, we asked them to become increasingly vulnerable to the content of the course and to participate fully. Parallel to the course material, we also engaged students in a series of contemplative exercises. I would like to spend the remainder of my time on these exercises.

I should mention that students quickly realized that *Eros and Insight* was like no other course at Amherst. Several students told us that they had given up on education, becoming cynical about it in high school. They learned to perform whatever was asked, even if it failed to connect to their lives, their deepest questions and most intense longings. Big jobs with big salaries were the material carrots for high performance, and Amherst was merely a means to that end. Set the bar anywhere, and they would jump over it, not out of sincere interest, but because they were smart and well trained. It took time to win them over, to reawaken in them the root aspiration that they all have, which is not primarily about education as an instrument for wealth acquisition. Instead, it is about transformation, development, and becoming all they can be. In my 25 years of teaching, *Eros and Insight* was the most gratifying teaching experience I have ever had. I am especially grateful to the students who trusted us to lead them into new territory and experiences.

THE FIRST CLASS

We told them, "This is the first day of your new life. You have gotten into Amherst College; you are no longer at home; what will you make of this precious life which you begin today?" Then we handed out passages from Henry David Thoreau's *Walden* (1854/1966) and Simone Weil's *Gravity and Grace* (1947/1987).

I went to the woods because I wished to live deliberately, to front only the essential facts of life, and see if I could not learn what it had to teach, and not, when I came to die, discover that I had not lived. (p. 61)

Here an initial theme of the course is introduced. What does it mean to go to the woods? Thoreau sought a place apart in order to live mindfully and deliberately. We will do likewise, setting apart times to be mindful and deliberate so that we too can learn to discern the essential facts of life. In the rush of our lives, we too often pass them by. As part of thee silent, and reflect, and in this patient, quiet, way we will learn.

In Thoreau's (1854/1966) description of the morning, we met a second essential theme of the course: becoming awake.

The millions are awake enough for physical labor; but only one in a million is awake enough for effective intellectual exertion, only one in a hundred millions to a poetic or divine life. To be awake is to be alive. I have never yet met a man who was quite awake. How could I have looked him in the face? (pp. 60–61)

The students had been admitted to Amherst because they proved that they could handle intellectual exertion, and what more remained? By the end of the hour, many longed to waken to a poetic or divine life, and so truly be alive.

Simone Weil (1947/1987) wrote of the ubiquitous power of gravity, which is everywhere and orders all things—except grace. Grace alone defies gravity's grasp, but it requires special conditions in order to appear. Weil says, "Grace fills empty spaces but it can only enter where there is a void to receive it" (p. 55). Simone Weil evokes the powerful importance of silence, emptiness, openness, the Void. Meditation helps us enter the space of silence and to foster the openness into which grace can appear.

Quite naturally, our conversation with the students moved to a final series of slides showing a Zen garden and a pond with ripples: Basho's (1686/1967) haiku, and their first meditation exercise of five minutes of silence, ended the class.

Breaking the silence
Of an ancient pond
A frog jumped into the water—
A deep resonance.

The students were to continue the exercise with silence on their own. We assigned a single one-page paper of pure description on the stages and experience of meditating silence. No flights of imagination or sophisticated scientific or philosophical analysis—only simple, attentive, deliberate, and descriptive prose.

SUSTAINED ATTENTION

The second exercise is on sustained attention and the cultivation of the so-called afterimage. Any sense object will do, but take a bell sound. The meditation has three phases that we perform, and a fourth that is grace. (1) Sound the bell three times. Listen intently to its form and timbre. (2) Even after the bell sound has died away to outer silence, we possess the memory of the bell sound. We can resound the bell inwardly. Do so. Listen to its inner reverberation, again and again. (3) The third phase is that of silence. Allow the memory of the bell sound to fade, releasing all sound, and opening the attention wide. The appropriate mood for this state is wonderfully characterized in Lao-tsu's (c. 500 B.C.E./1988) *Tao Te Ching*.

The Master doesn't seek fulfillment.
Not seeking, not expecting
She is present, and can welcome all things. (p. 15)

(4) The fourth phase is not enacted by us, but may presence itself in the silent space thus prepared and sustained. In Buddhaghosa's (A.D. 350/1975, pp. 143–204) description of the so-called ten *kasinas* or devices (earth, water, air, fire, four colors . . .), this is called the afterimage phase. During this phase, the inner aspect of the bell sound, or other sense experiences used in the same way, arise in the silence or void.

MAINTAINING OPENNESS

True single-pointed attention is, by definition, oblivious to everything outside the immediate field of attention. Contemplative inquiry moves out from sustained, focused attention to open attention. When we release the bell sound, we already are approaching this stage of practice. However, it can become the main feature of the exercise by using relationship as the focus of attention. Any comparison will do, but one we have used is the simplest value-scale exercise common to artistic training. Giving the students paper, brush, and black and white acrylic paints, we ask

them to make a graded sequence of gray squares that move evenly from white to black.



We use this and other comparison exercises to cultivate a sense for relationship and the inner discernment of difference, which we see as the first feature of contemplative *cognition*. One moves from single states of awareness to the direct perception of differences and similarities. This is a key moment. If we intend to connect contemplation to knowing, to *veritas*, then we must articulate an understanding of contemplative practice that moves from the psychological and health benefits of meditation (which are great) to its cognitive dimensions.

SUSTAINING CONTRADICTION

The fourth stage of contemplative inquiry proved especially challenging for our bright Amherst students. Whenever they have been thrown a problem, they want to solve it. If they encounter a contradiction, they resolve it. Reality is often resistant to this approach, and for good reasons. I lectured them about wave-particle duality in physics, and Joel spoke about the artistic tension produced by antagonistic elements in great works of art. We sent them to the art museum in pairs to look at particular portraits that had the strange habit of looking back. We put one student on one side of the gallery and another on the opposite side. The painting looks at each; it looks in two directions simultaneously. Impossible. The 15th-century cardinal Nicolas of Cusa (1453/1960), who recommended this exercise to his monks, called this and similar phenomena a coincidence of opposites. Think about it, hold the contradiction, and instead of resolving it, sustain it—practice sustaining contradiction.

But the deep significance of cultivating a consciousness that can sustain contradiction was appreciated only when it came home to our students during one of our informal evening conversations. Several of our racially mixed and ethnically diverse students began to speak about the irreconcilable complexity of their own lives that had caused them great uncertainty and personal suffering for years. Were they Chinese or American, how did the Haitian home they had just left (so full of life, spoken Kréyol and deep religiosity) relate to the life of the pristine mind and raucous campus life they were pursuing here at Amherst? Were they betraying their lineage? Did they need to decide between their contradictory identities? How could they? Their very lives required them to sustain a huge contradiction. As the Lebanese-French writer Amin Maalouf (2003) has put it, it is precisely

through the irreconcilable complexities of our lives that our identity emerges. When we deny that complexity, as a society we quickly decompose into warring ethnic and religious factions vying for dominance.

DEVELOPING SELF-LOVE

Only when we reached this turning point were we and the class ready to speak of love explicitly, because the architecture and life of love is animated by impossible contradictions. We long to be one with the beloved without in the least damaging or distorting her. We study the troubadours and their *chansons*, which repeatedly sing of love's contradictory nature, as these lines from Arnaut Daniel (n.d.) of the 13th century show:

I never held but it holds me
all the time in its bail Love
and makes me glad in anger, fool in wisdom
as one that never can fight back,
because a man that loves well, cannot defend himself.

Love is at once painful and joyful, a "sweet sorrow." Love can begin with ourselves, accepting and even delighting in the contradictory elements out of which we are composed. Am I a scientist, a poet, or a spiritual seeker? Yes, to all of them. The structures of our institutions of higher education belie this complexity. At best they struggle to capture it through interdisciplinary conversations between representatives from different disciplines. These often play out like negotiations between nations or ethnic groups at the United Nations. More is required, much more, if we are to integrate these diverse elements without dissolving them, and it starts by leveraging the contradictions in ourselves. This can only happen if we love the contradictions, and so love ourselves.

DEVELOPING LOVE OF OTHERS

The well-known Buddhist loving-kindness meditation allows one to gradually widen the circle of one's compassionate and loving attention. Starting from oneself, we then go on to someone close (a friend, relative, spouse). We wish them peace, joy, well-being. We continue to widen the circle of our loving attention still further to those we do not know well, wishing them also peace, joy, and well-being. And finally, we choose someone who is troublesome and difficult in our life. Even to them, we wish peace, joy, and well-being.

By this time, we are reading Plato's *Symposium*, his great dialogue on love. Love, as taught to Socrates by Diotima, is not only practiced toward other persons but also toward beauty in nature and toward the great institutions

that embody our highest ideals. Ultimately we love the ideal forms that are reflected everywhere throughout the beautiful in both natural and human creations. The “ladder of love,” however, not only leads up to the realm of pure forms, but it also descends to the mundane. In the closing pages of the dialogue, the drunken Alcibiades describes his genuine love of Socrates, and dares to speak of the noble life of his teacher. These are words that testify to a life lived in love for his students and for his fellow Athenians, and the eternal ideals of truth, beauty, and goodness—a love that was repaid with a cup of hemlock.

LOVING THE DEED

An important figure in our course at this point is the beguine Marguerite Porete, who died around 1310. In her book *The Mirror of Simple Souls*, Porete (1290/1993) used the new language of *fin amor* as sung by the troubadours in Old Provençal to describe her *amor de loing*, her “love from afar.” In her case, her distant love was not for an earthly companion but for God. Through the intensity of her love for her beloved, she realized that true moral action was not guided by the rules of what she called “the church of the little,” but by the great church of love. In place of the theological Virtues, from which she declared herself free, she espoused action guided by love alone, quoting Saint Augustine of Hippo (A.D. 416/2004): “Love, love and do what you will.” Her espousal of love as the true guide for action brought her into conflict with certain bishops within the Catholic Church of France. As a result she was arrested, imprisoned, and tried before the Inquisition in Paris. She refused to recant her love and views and was thus condemned to die by fire for “The Heresy of the Free Spirit.” At her execution, all cried when they saw with what quiet nobility she met her death.

Students are deeply moved by Porete’s valiant, though tragic, life. We ask them to meditate on Augustine’s line, “Love, love and do what you will,” which was at the heart of Porete’s life, and to write on how eros and insight are here raised to a form of contemplative knowing. After all, Marguerite Porete knew something so surely that she could stand silently and confidently before the greatest scholars of the Paris Inquisition without wavering. Loving love had granted her an insight or *aperçu* for which she was willing to die. To do otherwise would have been to betray her beloved.

REIMAGINING YOUR EDUCATION

Our final assignment to our students was to reimagine their Amherst College education in light of eros and insight. They had studied Kepler and Rembrandt; they had read Oliver Sacks, Niels Bohr, Barbara McClintock, Albert Einstein, and Werner Heisenberg. They had read the troubadours,

Merton, Rilke, T. S. Eliot, and Plato on love. In addition they had meditated on silence, attention, openness, contradiction, self-love, love of others, and love of the deed. What, we asked, should education—their education—be in light of all this? This was their final paper assignment: Redesign your Amherst education in light of eros and insight, in light of the relationship between love and knowledge.

Upton and I ended *Eros and Insight* with an image suggested to us by a pair of students in our initial offering of the course. In its simplest form, the visual metaphor is a doorway or entry composed of two posts with a lintel spanning the space between them. The two posts are a visual metaphor for the course's two parts: eros and insight. As our students pointedly recognized, eros can quickly be debased to lust, but insight can also be diminished to instrumental reasoning alone. Yet eros can also be enhanced to become the lintel of love, which seems to imply that the enhancement of insight becomes love as well, a knowing that is also a loving, an epistemology of love.

In this manner, as it turns out, the task first put to us by Rilke (1904–1925/1975)—learning to love—is also the task of learning to know in its fullest sense. Karl Jaspers (1957/1974) quoted Nicolas of Cusa concerning the highest form of human knowing, saying, “knowledge is here identical with love and love identical with knowledge” (p. 51). An epistemology of love is not a flight from reason to sentiment. The academy has nothing to fear from contemplative inquiry; indeed, such inquiry is in some measure already part of a covert curriculum that educates for discovery, creativity, and social conscience.

As contemplative educators, I believe that we are all engaged in an important project, one with a long tradition. The project of ancient philosophy was to live a right life, to embody virtue not only legislate it, to engender creativity and the capacities for insight, not only memorize formulae and works of art. As Hadot (1995/2002) put it, the ancients' education was “a course of training which would make them simultaneously contemplatives and men of actions—since knowledge and virtue imply each other” (p. 90).

In his final paper for *Eros and Insight*, Rajiv (not his real name) confessed that he was now unsure what to tell his parents about his career plans. His mother was a nuclear physicist and his father was a neurosurgeon. They expected a six-figure salary for him immediately upon graduation, and prior to the course, he had gone along with their expectations. In his final paper, he wrote, “How do I tell them that now the only thing I want to be in life is a lover?” Given his formidable talents, I feel confident that Rajiv will succeed outwardly, but I hope that he remembers to live deliberately, to cultivate silence, attention, and relational awareness, and even to sustain contradictions. Then he will be vulnerable to and participate in the mysteries that are everywhere around him. He will move from being a spy to being a lover whom nature will accept. In the process, he will

reform himself, shaping organs for cognition, for a high kind of seeing that can constitute true theory. The ethic associated with this epistemology is one that he can live by. Because at this highest level, which is the level of deep contemplation, knowing and loving are one, his actions will be virtuous and his words true. He will, in some measure, have accomplished the greatest and most difficult task of all, that for which everything else is but a preparation: He will have learned to love.

Notes

1 See also P. Palmer (1983), *To know as we are known*, chaps. 1 and 2. San Francisco: Harper.

2 Goethe in a letter to Soret of December 30, 1823, quoted by Rike Wankmüller, *Goethes Schriften* (Vol. 13, p. 616), Hamburger Ausgabe, Munich, Germany: Verlag C. H. Beck. "In science, however, the treatment is null, and all efficacy lies in the aperçu."

3 "Every morning in the early part of the above-cited month [October], on my coming down to breakfast, your (then) little brother William Edwin, and yourself, used to ask me, 'Well, Papa, can you *multiply* triplets?' Where to I was always obliged to reply, with a sad shake of the head: 'No, I can only *add* and *subtract* them.' But on the 16th day of the same month—which happened to be a Monday, and a Council day of the Royal Irish Academy—I was walking in to attend and preside, and your mother was walking with me, along the Royal Canal, to which she had perhaps driven; and although she talked with me now and then, yet an *under-current* of thought was going on in my mind, which gave at last a *result*, whereof it is not too much to say that I felt *at once* the importance. An *electric* circuit seemed to *close*; and a spark flashed forth, the herald (as I *foresaw, immediately*) of many long years to come of definitely directed thought and work, by *myself* if spared, and at all events on the part of *others*, if I should even be allowed to live long enough distinctly to communicate the discovery. Nor could I resist the impulse—unphilosophical as it may have been—to cut with a knife on a stone of Brougham Bridge, as we passed it, the fundamental formula with the symbols, *i, j, k*; namely, $i^2 = j^2 = k^2 = ijk = -1$ which contains the *Solution* of the *Problem*." Letter of Hamilton's: <http://www.maths.tcd.ie/pub/HistMath/People/Hamilton/Letters/BroomeBridge.html>.

4 For further details on the course, see the article "Eros and Insight" in *Amherst Magazine*, and the associated Web links (<http://www.amherst.edu/magazine/issues/04spring/>). Also see my article: Zajonc, A. (2003). Spirituality in higher education: Overcoming the divide. *Liberal Education*, 89, 50–58.

References

- Augustine of Hippo. (2004). *St. Augustin on Homilies on the Gospel of John, Homilies on the First Epistle of John and Soliloquies*. Whitefish, MT: Kessinger (Original work written A.D. 416, Homily on First Epistle of John, ¶ 8).
- Basho, M. (1967). *The Narrow Road to the Deep North and other travel sketches* (N. Yuasa, Trans.) London: Penguin. (Original work published 1686).
- Buddhaghosa (1975). *Path of purity: Being a translation of Buddhaghosa's Visuddhimagga* (Pe Maung Tin, Trans.). London: Pali Text Society. (Original work written A.D. 350).
- Daniel, A. (n.d.) I never held but it holds me. In *Complete Works*. Retrieved May 16, 2006, from http://www.trobar.org/troubadours/arnaut_daniel/arnaut_daniel_02.php.
- Emerson, R. W. (1903–1904). *The complete works of Ralph Waldo Emerson*, (Vol. 8). (E. W. Emerson, Ed.) Cambridge, MA: Riverside Press.

- Emerson, R. W. (1926). *Emerson's essays*. New York: Thomas Y. Crowell. (Original work published 1844).
- Goethe, J. W. (1988). *Scientific studies* (D. Miller, Ed. & Trans.). New York: Suhrkamp.
- Hadot, P. (2002). *What is ancient philosophy?* (M. Chase, Trans.). Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press. (Original work published 1995)
- Jaspers, K. (1974). *Anselm and Nicholas of Cusa* (H. Arendt, Ed., & R. Manheim, Trans.). New York: Harcourt Brace Jovanovich. (Original work published 1957)
- Kegan, R. (1982). *The evolving self*. Cambridge, MA, Harvard University Press.
- Kegan, R. (1994). *In over our heads*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.
- Lao-tsu. (1988). *Tao Te Ching* (S. Mitchell, Trans.). New York: Harper Collins. (Original work written circa 500 B.C.E.)
- Maalouf, A. (2003). *In the name of identity: Violence and the need to belong*. London: Penguin.
- Merleau-Ponty, M. (1962). Preface. *Phenomenology of perception* (C. Smith, Trans.). London: Routledge. (Original work published 1945)
- Mezirow, J. (2000). *Learning as transformation*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Montessori, M. (1972). *Education and peace* (H. R. Lane, Trans.). Chicago: Regnery.
- Nicolas of Cusa. (1960). *The vision of God* (E. G. Salter, Trans.). New York: Frederick Ungar. (Original work published in 1453)
- Palmer, P. (1993). *The violence of our knowledge: Toward a spirituality of higher education*. Retrieved February 10, 2005, from http://www.21learn.org/arch/articles/palmer_spirituality.html.
- Porete, M. (1993). *The mirror of simple souls* (E. L. Babinsky, Trans.). New York: Paulist Press. (Original work written 1290)
- Rilke, R. M. (1954). *Letters to a young poet* (M. D. Herder Norton, Trans.). New York: W. W. Norton. (Original work written 1904)
- Rilke, R. M. (1975). *Rilke on love and other difficulties* (J. J. L. Mood, Trans.) New York: W. W. Norton. (Original work published 1904–1925)
- Schrödinger, E. (1967). *Mind and matter*. Cambridge, England: Cambridge University Press. (Original work published 1956)
- Sloan, D. (1993). *Insight-imagination*. Westport, CT: Greenwood Press.
- Steiner, R. (1995). *Die Verbindung zwischen Lebenden und Toten* (A. Zajonc, Trans.). GA 168. Dornach, Switzerland: Rudolf-Steiner-Verlag. (Originally a lecture from 1916)
- Sternberg, R. J., & Davidson, J. E. (1995). *The nature of insight*. Cambridge, MA, MIT Press.
- Thoreau, H. D. (1966). *Walden and civil disobedience* (O. Thomas, Ed.). New York: W. W. Norton. (Original work published 1854)
- Weil, S. (1987). *Gravity and grace* (A. Wills, Trans.). New York: Ark. (Original work published 1947)

ARTHUR ZAJONC is professor of physics at Amherst College, where he has taught since 1978. He received his Ph.D. in physics from the University of Michigan, followed by a 2-year postdoctoral fellowship at the Joint Institute for Laboratory Astrophysics in Boulder, Colorado. He has been visiting professor and research scientist at the Ecole Normale Supérieure in Paris, the Max Planck Institute for Quantum Optics, the University of Rochester, and the University of Hannover. He has been Fulbright professor at the University of Innsbruck in Austria. His research has included studies in electron-atom collisions, radiative transfer, parity violation in

atoms, the experimental foundations of quantum physics, and the relationship between sciences and the humanities. He has written extensively on Goethe's science. He is author of *Catching the Light*, coauthor of *The Quantum Challenge*, and coeditor of *Goethe's Way of Science*. Zajonc has served as a scientific coordinator for the Mind and Life dialogues with H. H. the Dalai Lama. The 1997 and 2003 dialogues have led to the books *The New Physics and Cosmology: Dialogues With the Dalai Lama* and *The Dalai Lama at MIT*. He is also director of the Academic Program of the Center for Contemplative Mind in Society.

8 ANALYSIS

As it was mentioned earlier, for this monograph work a technical text was translated. It is considered technical because the original text contains specific vocabulary (terminology referred to a particular area) about education with an emphasis in contemplation. Due to this, terms about meditation, yoga, and mindfulness were present throughout the article, and these usually posed a significant challenge for the translator. Therefore, it was very important to consult with one of the experts in this area at the University of Quintana Roo, professor Argelia Peña Aguilar, who has been researching and implementing contemplation in education for the last years, too. Additionally to that, the translator-researcher had to delve deeply into the field to understand the meaning of such terminology in the educational context. Therefore, intense readings were developed to accomplish general understanding of the field at hand. Lastly, a review of Vinay and Darbelnet's taxonomy was done to reconsider the array of options according to their proposal to solve the linguistic problems arisen.

In this particular chapter, the translator elucidates the procedures employed for the translation task. For this purpose, the methodology proposed by Jean-Paul Vinay and Jean Darbelnet will be used. According to them, the following first seven techniques (direct and indirect examples) are at morphosyntactic level. And the last three (expansion, reduction and compensation) are at semantic level and they are supplementary to the first seven.

Thus, the translator of this article will present instances taken from the original and the translated versions, furthermore the pages will be shown for the reader to check the examples in context if needed.

Direct translation examples:

Direct Translation Techniques are used when structural and conceptual elements of the source language can be transferred into the target language. (Vinay and Jean Darbelnet, 1958, p.31)

Borrowing

There were some concepts that do not exist in the target language, or that are broadly used in the target language as they are in the original, so the translator opted for the source language form and kept it in the final translation as it is explained in the examples provided below. Furthermore, the translator decided to keep the following original words since the author of the article included them especially for the connotation they have in the source text.

Examples:

- a) **Tao TeChing**(p. 38, line 21)

Tao TeChing is the title of a Chinese book translated in Spanish as, “*El libro del Camino y la virtud*”. As it is the name of a very classical and ancestral book, it was important for the translator to keep the original title of the book as the article’s author did. However, the Spanish translation of the book’s title was written between brackets next to the English book’s name in the final translation in order to bring the Spanish reader a clearer and comprehensible reading.

- b) **Dalai Lama** (p. 47, line 12)

Dalai Lama is the title of Tibetan Buddhism leader. "Dalai" is original from Mongolian which *means* "ocean" and "Lama" is original from Tibetan which *means* "the highest principle". As this concept is new in the target language the translator decided to have it in the final translation as the author did.

- c) **Bildung**(p. 32, line 12)

Bildung German means education and formation. This word was used in the English version because the author wanted to keep the essence of the concept in the English text, so this was the main reason why the translator decided to keep it, too.

The three borrowing examples above are from different languages and origins, therefore it was challenging for the translator to look for the meaning of these expressions. In the translation, it was not necessary to write footnotes when the translator used the “borrowing” technique because the meaning of the words were written in the text between brackets.

Literal

This technique was the one most employed for this task, as it was not necessary to make too many changes other than those required by the target language grammar (syntactical changes mostly).

Examples:

a) **Contemplative education is transformative educación.**

La educación contemplativa es educación transformativa.

(p. 28, line 15)

b) **Ironically, I believe that we first need to recognize and accept as part of our existential reality the separation or solitude that we experience.**

Irónicamente, creo que primero necesitamos reconocer y aceptar como parte de nuestra realidad existencial la separación o soledad que experimentamos.

(p. 29, line 2)

c) **AN EPISTEMOLOGY OF LOVE**

UNA EPISTEMOLOGÍA DEL AMOR

(p. 29, line 1)

The examples above were translated word for word, but changes regarding to order of words, adding of articles and omission of subject pronouns were necessary to keep the natural tone in Spanish. For the first example, the article “*la*” was added at the beginning. Additionally, the order of noun-adjective is inversed in Spanish and it is changed to “*la educación contemplativa*” instead of “contemplative education”. For the second example, “I believe” becomes “*creo*”, so the subject is implied in the verb used in Spanish, same modification was done for “we need” and “we experience”. In the third example, the order of words doesn’t change and just an article was joined to a preposition, so the phrase “of love” becomes “*del amor*” in the final version.

It is very common to use Literal translation when simple adjustments in language are made for the transfer of ideas. This procedure is present considerably in the translation English-Spanish, as some authors have stated, and the translator verified by herself with this project that this is so, as well.

Calque

Through this translation the calque technique was not used in spite of the linguistic and cultural differences between English and Spanish languages. The translator could keep the style of the author in the translated text without having to translate any borrowed English word.

Calque, consider also as loan translation, is a special kind of borrowing technique which is translated literally and a new concept word is introduced and translated. Calque may introduce a structure that is stranger from the TL. Moreover, this technique is widely used by translators to deal with names of international organizations and specific vocations or subjects such as science and law. During the analysis procedure the translator did not find any calque example.

The oblique or indirect translation techniques

Oblique Translation Techniques are used when the structural or conceptual elements of the source language cannot be directly translated without altering the linguistic elements of the target language (Ibid).

Transposition

This technique was required when the translator needed to replace one word class with another without changing the meaning of the original message.

Examples:

a) **How would you respond?**

(Verb)

¿Cuál sería la respuesta? (p. 26, line 27)

(Noun)

In this example the verb “respond” was changed into the noun “*respuesta*”. However, the original message was not modified in the target language.

b) **And we have heard how important it can be to establish peace. . .**

(Adjective)

Además, hemos escuchado sobre la importancia de estar en armonía. . .

(Noun)

(p. 26, line 11)

In this translation the adjective “important“ was replaced by the noun “*importancia*”. In the two transposition examples there were grammatical changes without changing the original idea or meaning of the source text.

Modulation

In the following translations there were some variations in the message, obtained by a change from the point of view of the translator (Vinay and Darbelnet, 1958). Thus, other words may be employed in order to express the same idea.

Examples:

a) . . . **an enormous breach of etiquette** . . .

Modulation . . . una violación a las normas de etiqueta. . . (p. 26, line 20)

Literal . . . una enorme brecha de etiqueta. . .

If the translator had used the literal technique, the translation would not have sounded natural. In addition, there is a significant difference between the word “*violación*” and “*brecha*”, the first one having a stronger meaning in comparison to the second, which is exactly what the translator believes the original author meant to convey. Moreover, the modulated phrase is of common use in the target language.

b) **Rajiv (not his real name)**. . .

Modulation Rajiv (seudónimo). . . (p. 44, line 25)

Literal Rajiv (no su nombre real). . .

Spanish uses sometimes more formal terminology than the English language does. So, the translator chose in this case the modulation to present an appropriate translation for the

expression “not his real name”. “*Seudónimo*” can be considered more cult in contrast to the original expression in English. Modulation is present when this kind of change is done.

c) **Need I say it?**

(Question)

Modulation No hay necesidad de remarcarlo. (p. 27 line 10)

(Negativesentence)

Literal ¿Necesito decirlo?

(Question)

In this example the “question” was turned into a “negative” sentence because in Spanish language it is very common to use a negative sentence when people want to emphasize an intention or, like in this case, the lack of it. The modulation was the most applicable technique due to this Spanish version sounds more natural in the translator’s native tongue than the literal one.

Equivalence

When a translator has to work with idioms, sayings, clichés, onomatopoeias or proverbs he applies this technique. Furthermore, equivalence consists of presenting the same idea with different stylistic and structural methods (Ibid).

Examples:

a) **Preventing conflicts is the work of politics;
establishing peace is the work of education.**

La tarea de la política es prevenir los conflictos;

la de la educación es establecer la paz. (p. 26, line 1)

This first example is a proverb written by Maria Montessori in her book *Education and Peace* in 1992.

b) material carrots

incentivos materiales (p. 36, line 11)

In the article's context "carrots" refers to rewards (something that is offered to someone in order to encourage that person to do something). It is a figurative phrase (a metaphor).

c) Set the bar anywhere, and they would jump over it. . .

Superarían el estándar que se les pusiera. . . (p. 36, line 12)

The phrase "set the bar" means to establish a level of quality for others to meet. It is an idiom.

The first example is a proverb quoted as aphorisms (statements of truth or opinion expressed in a concise and terse manner) by Maria Montessori. The second instance is a figurative phrase (a metaphor which is applied to an object or action to which it is not literally applicable. It is regarded as representative or symbolic of something else, especially something abstract). The third one is an idiom (a word or phrase that is not taken literally. It refers to a dialect of a group of people, either in a certain region or a group with common interests, like in science, music, art, and mainly when people share the same culture). For that reason, the most appropriate technique used by the translator was the equivalence one.

Adaptation

In adaptation technique the translator has to create new situations that can be considered as a kind of equivalent to the TL. Also, this technique is used when the words referred by the SL message are unknown in the TL culture (Vinay and Darbelnet, 1958).

Example:

a) **Eros**

Amor (p.35, line 9)

In the Greek mythology “Eros” means love and sex. The translator had to investigate about the word and its origin, this research is essential when this type of technique is used. In Spanish the word “Eros” exists and means instincts that are manifested as impulses to gratify basic needs (as sex). However, the word “Eros” is not generally used in Spanish with the same sense as it is employed in English by the author. Therefore, the translator decided to only use the concept “*Amor*”. This would be considered to be a technique named synecdoche or metonymy, in which a specific part of a concept is used to refer to the whole and involves the substitution of one term for another (Vinay and Jean Darbelnet, 1958, p.350). This would be modulation in a strict way, but, as the word “*Amor*” affects the translation in a more global way, this is considered Adaptation. The word “*Amor*” was the more appropriate for what this name represents, due to sense of the original text, as Contemplative Education refers to this precisely.

The last three following techniques are also considered by Vinay and Darbelnet and they are supplementary to the first seven. These do not correspond directly to a grammatical relation, they are more about conceptual notions (semantic level).

Expansion or amplification

The translator applied this technique for structural reasons. This procedure consists of adding more words to the target message without affecting the original meaning (Lopez and Minett,

1999). The translator has to take care of not abusing of amplification by giving extra information, unless it is done consciously or for specific requests, like those done by editorials.

Examples:

a) **Ideally, . . .**

De manera ideal, . . . (p. 31, line 5)

b) **The role of contemplative practice in adult education. . .**

El papel que desempeña la práctica contemplativa en la educación paraadultos. . .

(p. 25, line 5)

c) **. . . students deeply appreciate the shift from conventional coursework to a moreexperiential, transformative, and reflective pedagogy.**

. . . los estudiantes aprecian profundamente el cambio en la forma de trabajar de un curso convencional a una pedagogía más experimental, transformativa y reflexiva.

(p.25, line 24)

d) **Yes, certainly.**

La respuesta a todas las preguntas es, si, por supuesto.

(p. 27, line 20)

In the four examples above, the expansion procedure was applied because the translator shifted from the implicit to the explicit. In the first instance, the adverb “ideally”was transformed in an adverbial locution as, “*de manera ideal*”. In the last three expansion examples some elements were added for greater comprehensibility.

Reduction

In the following instances, the translator removed some elements without modifying the original sense of the source text (Ibid). In reduction procedure superfluous or misleading words are omitted because of structural and stylistic reasons.

Examples:

a) **Then we handed out passages. . .**

(Noun + Verb +Adv.)

Después repartimos pasajes. . . (p. 36, line23)

(Verb)

The subject is usually implicit in the verb in translations from English to Spanish. Additionally, the phrasal verb in English becomes just one element in Spanish.

b) . . . **that have ultimately worked against our fundamental human interests.**

(Adv. + Verb + Prep.)

. . . que contrarrestan nuestros intereses humanos fundamentales.

(Verb)

(p. 26, line 23)

The translator left out the word “ultimately” and the phrasal verb “worked against” was changed into one single word: “*contrarrestar*”, to avoid redundancy and to make the message more natural in the target language. Nevertheless, during this translation procedure, the translator had to make sure that no crucial information was omitted in the final translation.

Compensation

According to Vinay and Darbelnet, compensation introduces a SL element of information or stylistic effect in another place in the TL text because it cannot be reflected in the same place as in the SL. So, the aim of compensation is to balance the semantic losses that translation involves (either in the content of the message or its stylistic effects). This technique is a combination of the expansion and reduction procedures (Lopez and Minett, 1999).

During this translation process there was not a translation loss or need to rearrange concepts or meanings; they were all expressed in similar places as the original. As a result, compensation technique was not required in the translation of this article.

9.CONCLUSIONS

Translation breaks language barriers and, thanks to it, international information is conveyed to everyone, anywhere. A translator's endeavor is not easy. This work implies a great deal of responsibility, since it is about maintaining people informed, but informing in the best possible way with the right and exact information. Nevertheless, translation is also one of the most gratifying jobs in the world. Because of translators, people from different nationalities keep up dated and communicated in spite of their different languages and idiosyncrasies.

The translator's main purpose was to translate faithfully the article "*Love and Knowledge: Recovering the Heart through Contemplation*" written by Arthur Zajonc. As the translator of this monographic work had no experience in the translation area, she faced many difficulties through this process. For the first part of the process, and in order to develop the theoretical framework, it was necessary to look into specific information about Contemplative Education. A wide research was carried out in order to get familiar and have a clearer idea about the topic. Readings of books, articles on line, dictionaries and glossaries related to the theme were useful to have the required understanding to start this monographic work. In addition, for this first part, the translator decided to use the Canadian approach by Jean Paul Vinay and Jean Darbelnet due to the fact that this one is the most recognized, accepted and used by the professionals in this area.

Another challenge encountered was the translation of the article *per se*. Here, it was vital to recognize that the type of translation to carry out was a technical one since the specific terminology was related to Contemplative Education. On many occasions the translations of some words and phrases were not accurate, so it was required to reread the original and the translated text in order to compare, analyze and reformulate ideas. All of that was possible thanks to the supervision of two professors of the English Language Major at the University of Quintana Roo, Argelia Peña and Sonia Sansores who have professional experience in the translation field.

But, definitely, the most challenging part of this monograph was the analysis of the techniques used in the translation. The translator had to read as many times as was possible about

the techniques by Vinay and Darbelnet in order to study their examples deeply to be able to identify her own examples from the translated text.

All in all, the most significant findings and recommendations emanated from the translation experience that are stated below.

a) To consult with professionals in the area of Contemplative Education was of great importance, due to their knowledge of specialized words and terms as: meditation, yoga, and mindfulness that were misinterpreted by the novice translator of this work.

b) For the writing of the Spanish translation, it was necessary to have the supervision of an expert (Amparo Reyes) in order to avoid redundancy, mainly with pronouns, which in Spanish language are generally implicit in the verbs. Additionally, an excessive use of articles on the part of the translator was detected, specifically, in the transfer from English into Spanish.

c) Maintaining the philosophical, spiritual and scientific style of the author (Arthur Zajonc) while keeping the original idea of the article were not easy tasks. It was useful to read more about him and his work about science, mind, and spirit. Mainly, he likes to work in anthroposophic meditation which is specifically oriented towards modern consciousness, recognizing the importance of the individual and the unique character of each person.

d) It was essential to have the guidance of experts (Argelia Peña and Sonia Sansores) in the translation area, since for the translator it was her first formal experience in this field. The specialists helped to solve translation problems that the novice translator could not overcome by herself. Besides, the experienced translators guided the beginner translator to identify the techniques applied in the translation.

e) The techniques that were taken into account to carry out the analysis of this translation were the ones proposed by Vinay and Darbelnet. The most used were literal and expansion. The literal technique was frequently used due to the fact that it was not necessary to make many structural changes (only syntactical modifications mostly). And the procedure named expansion was necessary to add some words to be more explicit in the target text. The last being a technique judged necessary by the translator for the sake of the style.

f) Calque and Compensation were not required in this work. It was not necessary to translate any borrowed English word. Furthermore, during this translation process there was not a translation loss or need to reorder concepts, they were all expressed in similar places as in the original text.

g) During the analysis, the translator realized that the techniques used in her translation were combined, and that it was impossible to apply only one, mainly when working with long texts. Also, when translating, not all procedures elucidated by Vinay and Darbelnet must be used, more than one technique can be omitted without the risk of loss in meaning.

h) This document could serve as an example for students who want to carry out this type of translation task. The translation techniques and examples given in this paper could help to deal with future works like this.

There is no doubt that, for this inexperienced translator, this was the most complex, but rewarding work that she has undertaken. Therefore, as final conclusion, I can state that even though it was not a simple task and, in spite of the time it took, it was a very satisfying experience for me and I am looking forward to my next formal assignment in this field.

10. REFERENCES

Brower, R., (1991). *On Translation*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Davis J., (2005). *Contemplative Education*. Retrieved November 2, 2009 from <http://www.johnvdavis.com/tp/contedonline.htm>

Duff, A., (1989). *Translation*. Oxford: University Press.

Fawcett, P., (1997). *Translation and Language: Linguistic Theories Explained*. Manchester: St. Jerome.

García, V., (1989). *En torno a la traducción: Teoría. Crítica. Historia*. Madrid: Gredos.

GarrisonInstitute (2005). *Contemplation and Education: A Survey of Programs Using Contemplative Techniques in K-12 Educational Setting: A Mapping Report*. Retrieved November 2, 2009 from <http://www.garrisoninstitute.org>

Gross, A., (1996). *The History of Translation History*. Retrieved November 1, 2009 from <http://www.translationdictionary.com/article343.htm>

Jeff, T., (1999). *What is Education?* Retrieved November 3, 2009 from <http://www.infe.org/foundations/f-educ.htm>

Kabat, J., (2005). *Wherever You Go There You Are: Mindfulness Meditation In Every Life*. New York: Hyperon.

Langer, E., (1997). *The Power of Mindful Learning*. USA: Addison-Weley.

- Lefevere, A., (1992). *Translation/History/Culture: A Sourcebook*. London: Routledge.
- Leonardi, V., (2000). *Equivalence in Translation: Between Myth and Reality*. Retrieved October 31, 2009 from <http://www accurapid.com/journal/14Equiv>
- Lopez, J., & Minett, J. (1999). *Manual de traducción: Inglés/Castellano*. Barcelona: Gedisa.
- McCown, D. (2011). *Teaching Mindfulness: "A Practical Guide for Clinicians and Educators"*
New York: Springer
- Palmer, P., (1998). *The Courage to Teach*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.
- Palmer, P., & Zajonc, A. (2010) *"The Heart of Higher Education: A Call to Renewal"* USA:
Jossey-Bass.
- Robert L., (2009). *What is Education?* Retrieved November 3, 2009 from
http://www.motivation-tools.com/youth/what_is_education.htm
- Rosas, A., (2006). *Translation of Four Tales Taken from the Book "Cuentos de Cazadores" by Euleuterio Llanes Pasos, with a Detailed Analysis of the Techniques Used by the Translator*. A published Degree's thesis, Universidad de Quintana Roo. Chetumal.
- Schindelheim, F., (2004). *Relieving Classroom Stress: A Teacher's Survival Guide*. USA:
House.
- Shan, B., (2012). *The three different basic functions of language*. Retrieved March 10, 2013 from
<http://knowledgeforall79.blogspot.mx/2012/03/basic-functions-of-language.html>
- Smith, J., (2005). *Relaxation, Meditation & Mindfulness: Personal Training Manual*. Chicago: Lulu.

Stahl, B., & Goldstein, E. (2010) *A Mindfulness Based Stress Reduction Workbook*. USA: Harbinger.

Types of Translation. (n.d.). Retrieved November 2, 2009 from <http://www.kwintessential.co.uk/translation/articles/types.html>

Venuti, L., (1999). *The Translation Studies Reader*. Great Britain: Routledge.

Vinay, J. & Darbelnet, J, (1958) *Stylistique comparée du français et de l'anglais: méthode de Traduction* [Comparative Stylistics of French and English: A Methodology for Translation]. Paris: Didier

Why is education important? (n.d.). Retrieved November 2, 2009 from <http://www.buzzle.com/articles/why-is-education-so-important.html>

Wikipedia (2018). *Idiom*. Retrieved February 15, 2018 from <https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Idiom>

Zajonc, A., (2006). *Love and Knowledge: Recovering the Heart of Learning through Contemplation*. Teachers College Record: Contemplative Practices and Education Columbia: Blackwell.